

Part VII

Armed Forces Personnel : Pay Scales and Allowances

The leader must have infectious optimism

Field Marshall Bernard Montgomery

Section I

Introduction

Introduction

GENERAL

Our Terms of Reference

142.1 Our terms of reference in respect of the Armed Forces personnel are identical to the terms of reference for other Central Government employees. As brought out elsewhere, our terms of reference with regard to Armed Forces personnel represent a major departure from the terms of reference of the Third and Fourth CPCs. While these CPCs were not required to examine the terms and conditions of service of the Armed Forces personnel, we have been entrusted with the task of studying and making recommendations also on the various conditions of service of the Armed Forces Personnel like their terms of engagement, service tenure, age of retirement, qualifying service for promotion etc. as for other Central Government employees.

PROCEDURE OF WORK

Setting up of Cells

142.2 To enable the services to formulate their proposals in respect of service personnel, the Government set up special pay cells in the three Service Hqrs. under an officer of the rank of Major General and equivalent. Following the procedure adopted by earlier Pay Commissions, a cell was also set up by the government in the Ministry of Defence for handling of these matters in the Ministry.

Joint proposals

142.3 The Armed Forces submitted a joint memorandum containing their proposals on pay and allowances, and conditions of service and pensions. We are happy to note that it was for the first time that a joint memorandum on such issues was submitted to a CPC by the three Services. On receipt of the memorandum, we obtained the views of the Ministry of Defence on the proposals made by the Armed Forces. We also received supplementary demands from the Armed Forces in the form of addenda to the joint memorandum.

Consideration of proposals

142.4 In order to consider the proposals in detail, we had several discussions with the representatives of the Armed Forces Pay Commission Cells and officers of the Ministry of Defence. A substantial amount of supplementary

comprehensive presentation of their proposals which also provided us an opportunity to clarify the position with regard to many service matters

Discussions held 142.5 As per normal practice we had discussions with the three Service Chiefs to obtain their specific views on the proposals and other connected matters. Useful discussions were also conducted with the Financial Adviser (Defence Services), two retired Chiefs of Naval and Air Staff and a retired Army Commander which enabled us to gain a broader understanding of the issues involved.

Studies Commissioned 142.6 On two major issues, we felt the need for a more detailed examination and requested the Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses (IDSA) to conduct a study on 'Manpower Optimisation in the Armed Forces' and the National Institute of Nutrition (NIN) to conduct a review of Ration Scales for Personnel of the Armed Forces. These studies were useful in formulating our proposals on the above mentioned aspects.

Visits undertaken 142.7 To see the conditions under which Service personnel have to operate, we visited some of the forward areas and also witnessed exercises arranged by the three services. These visits also enabled us to interact with a cross-section of Service personnel and identify their specific concerns.

Role and Operating Scenario

INTRODUCTION

*General
Introduction.*

143.1 India has land and maritime boundaries with eleven countries. The Government is responsible for ensuring the defence of the country and maintaining its territorial integrity. The main objective of our defence policy is to promote and sustain durable peace. Towards this end, our Defence Forces have to be kept adequately equipped to counter any attempt to challenge the country's territorial integrity and sovereignty. The role of our Armed Forces is consequently guided by our geographical situation, past experiences, contemporary concerns and constraints and our world view as a nation-state.

*Strategic
Background.*

143.2 The four wars that the country has fought have had their effect in shaping the growth and evolution of our Armed Forces. In fact, the 1962 war with China and 1971 war with Pakistan were watersheds in our military history and determined the force levels required to be maintained. Though we have not fought a full-fledged war since 1971, we have had to contend with many a covert and overt threat to our security. Since the late eighties, we have been battling a low intensity war through trans-border terrorism and insurgencies. The present strategic environment around us has eased a bit after the end of the cold war and improvement of our relations with China but it still poses challenges and the Armed Forces have to be kept in a state of readiness to meet all threats and eventualities.

*Defence
Preparedness.*

143.3 Our preparedness to meet the real and potential threats to our security is not only vital to our territorial integrity, it is also a necessary adjunct to the unhindered socio-economic development of our people. But given our commitment to international peace and security and the on-going resource constraints before us, we can not overpitch our defence preparedness. What we really need is a credible, cost-effective and affordable defence.

143.4 It is in the context of this scenario that the structure and role of our Armed Forces and the requirements of a well defined and clear defence policy are to be examined.

STRUCTURE AND ROLE OF THE INDIAN ARMY

Organisational Structure

143.5 The Indian Army, a volunteer force of around one million, is the fourth largest Army in the world. It is organised into five operational commands: Southern, Western, Eastern, Central and Northern, and one Training command responsible for evolving military doctrines for operations. Operational commands are responsible for all operations of war within their geographical limits. Each command controls three operational Corps, which in turn control operations of three to five Divisions. Apart from these, each Command controls a number of static formations like Areas, Sub-Areas, Training Establishments and logistic installations. The above structure is controlled by the Chief of Army Staff through Army Headquarters. He is assisted by the Vice Chief of Army Staff and seven Principal Staff Officers.

Role

143.6 The primary task assigned to the Army is to safeguard the territorial integrity of the nation against external threats. In addition, when specifically asked to do so, the Army has to assist the civil administration to quell internal disturbances and in the maintenance of law and order, in organising relief operations during natural calamities and in the maintenance of essential services.

STRUCTURE AND ROLE OF THE INDIAN NAVY

Organisational Structure

143.7 The Indian Navy is organised into two operational commands: Western and Eastern, and one training command: the Southern Command. The Chief of Naval Staff exercises both operational and administrative control on the Navy from Naval Headquarters. In discharging his functions, he is assisted by the Vice Chief of Naval Staff and three Principal Staff Officers.

Role

143.8 The defence of India's maritime interests is the primary responsibility of the Indian Navy. During war, it is tasked to defend the mainland and our island territories from seaborne attack, safeguard our sealines of communication, ports and harbours, prevent the enemy from using the seas for its purposes, launch attacks on the enemy from the sea and protect our offshore resources and safeguard the Exclusive Economic Zone. The peace-time role of the Navy includes fisheries protection, search and rescue of ships in distress, marine survey and oceanography. The Navy is also called upon to assist the Coast Guard and Indian Customs in anti-smuggling activities.

STRUCTURE AND ROLE OF THE INDIAN AIR FORCE

Organisation

143.9 The Indian Air Force is organised into seven commands on functional-cum-geographical basis. The five operational commands: Western, Eastern, Central, Southern and South-Western, are responsible for the planning and execution of all types of air operations within their respective geographical limits. The two functional commands: Training Command and Maintenance Command, are responsible for flying and ground training and for logistics and maintenance respectively. The Chief of the Air staff exercises both operational and administrative control of the Air Force from Air Headquarters. In discharging his

functions he is assisted by the Vice Chief of Air Staff and five Principal Staff Officers

Role

143.10 The primary role of the Indian Air Force is the defence of our national territory and essential communications against outside air attack and application of direct pressure during war on the enemy's power of resistance by attacks on vital military, industrial and economic centres across the borders. It also has a major responsibility to assist the other two services in the pursuit of their respective operational objectives even in areas of direct combat like Offensive Air Support and Maritime Strike, in addition to providing paradrop, troop lift, air maintenance, reconnaissance and communication assistance to the Army and Navy. The Air Force is also called upon to provide aid to civil authorities during natural calamities

REDEFINING THE ROLE

Changing Threat Scenario

143.11 The far-reaching changes and technological developments that have taken place since the beginning of the nineties, both at the global level and in our immediate neighbourhood, have brought about a qualitative change in our security environment. While the end of the cold war and the on-going Sino-Indian rapprochement are positive developments from the angle of our national security, the worrying points are the developments on the issues of nuclear non-proliferation and Missile Technology Control Regime, and Pakistan's attempt to embroil us in a low-cost proxy war and its nuclear designs. Though the emerging threat scenario precludes the possibility of a direct military confrontation with our adversaries, the possibility of non-military threats and pressures on us because of our forthright stand on the issues relating to indefinite extension of the Non-proliferation Treaty (NPT), the conclusion of Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty (CTBT) and indigenous missile development programme can not be ruled out.

Need for Reassessment

143.12 In the emerging threat scenario, we feel there is an urgent need to reassess both the country-specific and non-country specific challenges to our national security and to restructure our defence preparedness based on such assessment. Such an exercise should also be dovetailed to the need for modernisation of the Armed Forces and optimisation of defence expenditure in view of the ongoing resource constraints.

National Security Council

143.13 To this end, we recommend immediate constitution of a **Cabinet Committee on National Security and re-constitution of the National Security Council**. In our opinion, the National Security Council should be a broad-based institution having representation from Government, media, academia and independent strategic analysts and thinkers. It would serve as a think-tank on defence and national security matters as well as a forum for brain-storming on all issues impinging on national security, so as to provide necessary inputs to the Cabinet Committee on National Security on a continuing basis.

Involvement of the Army in internal Security Duties

143.14 The primary task of the Army is to defend our territorial integrity against external aggression and war and to remain ever prepared to meet any eventuality of war and external aggression. The current trends indicate that, the Army has been increasingly involved in internal security duties, which has not only put avoidable strain on the Army but is also affecting the ethos and morale of its

personnel. We strongly feel that though the Army should be available, it should not be routinely involved in internal security problems, the primary responsibility of which is that of the Ministry of Home Affairs. We have separately made recommendations elsewhere on reorganisation of Police Forces for counter-insurgency and internal security purposes.

*Rashtriya
Rifles*

143 15 In this context we feel that the need for having Rashtriya Rifles-a regular outfit of the Army-for internal security duties should be reviewed. We recommend that the Government should immediately disband the outfit and revert the engaged personnel to the main cadres of the Army, which is purportedly facing shortfalls at critical levels.

Modernisation

143 16 We have also gone into the initiatives taken by the Armed Forces in the context of the continuing rapid advancements in combat technology which require a commensurate pace of modernisation in the Armed Forces. We feel that heavier investment in modernisation is a must to sustain this pace. Considering that the cost of maintaining Defence manpower is high and that a sizeable portion of defence expenditure is spent on manpower and manpower related costs, it is imperative that these costs be reduced drastically so that the funds released can be used for acquisition of modern equipment. We suggest that a comprehensive modernisation plan in the backdrop of existing resource constraints be drawn up on an inter-service basis along with a manpower-optimisation plan with a view to adding more teeth to our defence preparedness.

Conclusion

143 17 Some suggestions have also been made by us with regard to the changing role of the Armed Forces and approach towards manpower optimisation. We think that suggestions made here and elsewhere would ultimately result in a more cost-effective and credible approach towards defence preparedness.

Morale and Quality of Armed Forces Personnel

GENERAL INTRODUCTION

Background

144.1 One of the major concerns governing our appreciation of the Armed Forces salary structure has been the need to provide a compensation package geared to enhance the morale and quality of both officers and men. While 'morale' in our opinion would basically pertain to serving personnel, 'quality' has a bearing on current and future intake

Shortfall of Intake

144.2 Central to the question of quality is the question of the attractiveness of the military career, specially in the context of the voluntary character of our Armed Forces. While no serious shortfall has been reported in recruitment of PBOR and in the officers' cadre of Navy and Air Force, a shortage of over 12,000 officers has been intimated in the Army. It has been stated by the Armed Forces Headquarters that the shortage can be ascribed to the inability of potential recruits to clear prescribed selection tests. The Indian Air Force has expressed concern over the disconcertingly low marks obtained by candidates selected through Services Selection Boards. The Navy has pointed out that materialistic priorities are becoming more important than the honour and prestige of serving in the Armed Forces. We observe that the shortfall of intake into the Army has also invited adverse comment from the Comptroller and Auditor General in their Report on Defence Services for the year ended 31 March 1995

The MARG Report

144.3 In order to formulate their proposals, the Armed Forces carried out studies with the help of consultants for ascertaining the expectations of potential recruits and the aspirations of existing personnel. They commissioned Marketing and Research Group (MARG) to carry out a study to assess career preferences and position of Armed Forces in the set of career options as well as to identify the factors contributing towards their unattractiveness

The CDM Study

144.4 Further, to evaluate the aspirations of existing personnel the College of Defence Management (CDM), Hyderabad was asked to conduct an opinion poll to establish major concerns of serving Armed Forces personnel relating to the structure of their emoluments and terms and conditions of service

Study by ABC

144.5 The Armed Forces also commissioned M/s ABC Consultants to conduct a comparative study of remuneration packages in various sectors of

employment profession, analyze compensation practices for defence services in other countries and carry out a pilot job evaluation study to determine the relative worth of jobs in officer cadre of Armed Forces with other Govt services. The Armed Forces have based their proposals on these three studies.

SERVICES PROPOSALS

Major Demands

144.6 The Services have suggested two options for restoring the attractiveness of the Armed Forces -the first to improve the psychic factor and the second to improve the emoluments structure. The 'psychic' factor is stated to flow from a sense of possessing authority and power, status and prestige, distinction in society at large and feeling of involvement in the governance of the country. It has been stated that the adverse changes in the relativity established through the Warrant of Precedence has been a major contributor to the deteriorating psychic factor and restoration of the position prevailing as per Warrants of Precedence before 1950 has been demanded. Besides this, the Armed Forces have emphasised the need to give special consideration to the constraints of their organizational and functional hierarchy which prevents creation of posts at higher levels and therefore results in limited career prospects with the accompanying psychological pressure of possible supersession. The long term solution in their opinion lies in a lean regular cadre and a wide Short Service Commission participation. As regards emoluments structure, the Armed Forces have suggested delinking of pay structure from rank structure on the lines of the present integrated pay scales both for officers and PBOR with relativities vis-a-vis civilians being based on pay rather than rank. In addition, compensation for turbulence, provision of housing and education of children have also been cited as major concerns. Another proposal is to provide an assured career upto the universal age of retirement through lateral induction for a second career option or as an alternative to provide adequate compensation in pensions.

OUR APPROACH TO MORALE AND QUALITY

Specific Areas of Shortfall in Intake

144.7 We have examined the issue of unattractiveness and find that no significant shortage has been reported in the case of Personnel Below Officer Rank. As regards officers, the data submitted by the Armed Forces on the intake into the Armed Forces shows that although the NDA and IMA entry have suffered a slight setback, significant shortfalls exist mainly in the Short Service Commission and the Technical Entry streams the recruitment to which is done directly through the Services Selection Boards (SSBs). The Defence Ministry have also reiterated this position.

Views of the Ministry

144.8 In the opinion of the Ministry of Defence, the reason for youngsters passing out of Universities, Schools etc. not having first preference for Armed Forces is because of the psychological shift in favour of doing soft jobs and the answer is to inculcate a shift in their attitudes. The Ministry has also stated that the number of applicants for the posts of officers in the Armed Forces is increasing every year. Therefore, while there is no shortage of applicants, there is a shortage of candidates clearing the induction tests.

C&AG Report

144.9 The C&AG Report has mentioned the low intake from among students from Sainik Schools and Military Schools, which are primarily meant for preparing students for entry into Defence Services and involve considerable expenditure to the Govt.

144.10 In our view, the shortfall in the regular entry could be attributed to the liberalised economic scenario and the removal of ceiling in private sector salaries, which have had an all round impact on the attractiveness of the Government Sector in general and have been discussed elsewhere. As regards the Short Service Commission, the uncertainty of resettlement after the prescribed tenure could be a dissuading factor for potential recruits. The MARG Report has indicated a high degree of sensitivity to the compensation package and has brought out that an additional 13% bright students would be willing to join the Armed Forces if the take home packet is increased to Rs 7000/- p.m. We find that the Third CPC, while considering the issue of shortfall in the intake of the officer cadre had held that "the quality of recruitment to the Armed Forces will be satisfactory only if service pays are comparable to levels of remuneration in civilian employment." Considering all these factors, we have recommended a starting salary of Rs.8250/- p.m. for Commissioned Officers of the Armed Forces giving them an edge over the Civil Services. We have also separately recommended that cadets during the period of training in Service Academies may be given a stipend of Rs.8000/- per month against the existing stipend of Rs.1500/- p.m. granted in the last six months of training. We feel that the higher starting salary coupled with the other benefits recommended specially for the Armed Forces would make them more attractive and lead to better response from the youth.

144.11 In addition, in order to attract the youth as also to influence perceptions, we suggest that purposive efforts may be made by the Armed Forces to give wide publicity through the media highlighting the advantages and special benefits available in a career in the Armed Forces. The constant refrain of the statements ascribed to the highest leadership in the Armed Forces only brings out the negative features of the present disenchantment of the youth with a military career. Such an attitude is bound to be counter-productive as it may dissuade even those young men who may otherwise be willing to join the Armed Forces for reasons of patriotism, love of adventure or a nationalistic sentiment.

144.12 Further, in order to overcome the existing shortfall of officers, students from Military Schools and Sainik Schools may be considered for direct entry into the Armed Forces on the basis of the results of Class XII examination coupled with special test, without having to go through the NDA entrance examination. Alternatively, students in these schools may be compulsorily required to serve in the Armed Forces for a period of 5 years on the lines of the Armed Forces Medical College, keeping in view the fact that expenditure is incurred by the Government on training these students. We also suggest that the Armed Forces may conduct a review of the strength of Service officers on deputation and permanent secondment to other organizations. We are of the view that through progressive civilianisation of those organizations, service officers could be withdrawn from them and deployed within the Armed Forces to overcome the shortages.

144.13 With the uncertain career of the Short Service Commissioned Officers in mind, we have recommended an increase in the reservation quota for ex-service personnel at the level of Assistant Commandants in CPOs from 10% to 25%. As a long-term measure we have suggested a Joint Recruitment Board to recruit personnel who would be required to serve for the first few years with the Armed Forces and would subsequently be laterally shifted to the Central Police Organizations. This scheme would also ensure protection of seniority and in our opinion make the Short Service Commission more stable and attractive.

144.14 We have also looked into the total package of benefits available to service personnel as compared to civilian employees. A large number of concessions and facilities are not available to civilian Gp. 'A' Officers which are available to service officers even in peace areas. These include free rations, subsidised license fees, electricity and water charges, free medical facilities, more liberal leave entitlements,

travel concessions, CSD facilities, weightage in qualifying service for pensions etc. Similarly PBOR are entitled to free food, accommodation, clothing, free medical facilities, concession vouchers for travel, liberal leave entitlements and compensation in pensions. Therefore, the total package of compensation available is tilted in favour of the Servicemen. The Ministry of Defence have further pointed out that the cadre reviews undertaken for officers from time to time have provided a substantial number of posts at higher levels and many posts earlier held by Colonels are now being held by Brigadiers or Major Generals. The provision of granting acting or officiating rank also results in higher monetary compensation to Defence Officers. Moreover, the provision of free food, accommodation and allied services to PBOR insulates them from inflationary trends and service in Armed Forces enables them to acquire at Government cost technical and other skills which are marketable in the civilian world. Besides, several schemes for rehabilitation of ex-servicemen have also been formulated by the Government and since 1992 near parity in pensions of past and present pensioners has also been provided.

Our Recommendations

144.15 We consider that all the existing additional benefits are morale-boosting measures and have made our recommendations elsewhere on the continuance of these special privileges. In addition, the following new provisions have also been suggested by us under the relevant Chapters:

1. **Grant of Assured Career Promotion Scheme to officers and PBOR to provide financial upgradation delinked from vacancies**
2. **Abolition of rank of Second Lieutenant**
3. **Reduction in time taken for substantive promotion of Service Officers.**
4. **Increase in weightage in qualifying service for pension.**
5. **Substantial increase in rates of CILQ.**
6. **Increase in rates of risk related and other allowances.**
7. **Introduction of a scheme of lateral entry into CPOs to provide a fuller career.**
8. **Introduction of liberal ex-gratia payment for casualties.**
9. **Scheme to grant near parity in pensions.**
10. **Enhanced percentages of reservation of posts in Government, and**
11. **Rationalisation of rules governing disability pension.**

Status as related to Warrant of Precedence

144.16 As regards the concern expressed by the Armed Forces regarding status as related to Warrant of Precedence, we feel it is not within our purview to suggest any changes in the Warrant of Precedence which is published after the approval of the President. The Ministry feels that the existing table is well balanced and does not require any change.

Conclusion

144.17 Taking into account the privileges already available to Armed Forces personnel and the new features suggested by us, we feel that the overall package of benefits would be such as to attract and motivate personnel of the right calibre to join the Armed Forces. We are also confident that it would help in maintaining the morale and dedication of the existing Service personnel.

Section II

Pay Scales

Principles of Pay Determination

HISTORICAL PRESPECTIVE

- General* 145.1 The pay structure of Armed Forces personnel has evolved over the years in pursuance of recommendations made by various Committees/Pay Commissions. The Third CPC had, for the first time, considered the emoluments structure of Armed Forces personnel. Prior to that, different Committees, namely the Post War Pay Committee, 1947 and the Raghuramiah Committee 1960, had recommended consequential changes in the Armed Forces salaries structure, based on recommendations made by the First CPC and Second CPC for civilians.
- Post War Committee* 145.2 The Post-War Pay Committee, which laid the foundation for the structure of emoluments of Armed Forces personnel of independent India considerably simplified the pay structure and abolished a number of allowances which had relevance only to war conditions or which could be merged in the pay. The basic principle followed by the Post War Pay Committee was one of "comparability" with civilian rates of pay under the Government and of an 'all inclusive nature of pay.'
- Raghuramiah Committee, 1960* 145.3 The Raghuramiah Committee did not make any changes in the pay structure and equivalence established by the Post War Pay Committee. For officers, the Committee considered that the accepted parallel between Defence Service Officers and Class I Services of the Central Govt., particularly the Indian Police Service should be continued. For the soldier also the accepted parallel with the semi- skilled industrial worker was not disturbed. In addition, the Committee recommended continuance of special allowances and concessions granted in the intervening period.
- Third CPC's views* 145.4 The Third CPC continued the principle of formulation of salaries on comparability with civilian rates of pay and based their recommendations using this yardstick. They felt that any comparison would necessarily have to be done in very broad terms as the service conditions were really not comparable. They examined the various conditions of service in the Armed Forces and felt that there were important features of military life which could be considered unique and not measurable by standards taken from civilian life.

Approach followed by Third CPC

145.5 The Third CPC also considered that the concept of an 'all inclusive military salary may not be feasible in the Indian context as the service personnel had got accustomed to the system of allowances and concessions in kind and any withdrawal of these would lead to resistance. With regard to allowances the Third CPC were therefore of the view that any element of service life which was a constant factor for bulk of the personnel should be compensated in pay itself and where the element varies considerably based on nature of work and place of posting or specially hazardous assignments, separate allowances may be granted

Principles followed by Fourth CPC

145.6 The Fourth CPC took note of the conditions of service while determining the compensation package and due consideration was given to the truncated career, rigid disciplinary code, frequent moves etc. For Personnel Below Officer Rank, the Fourth CPC opined that the duties and responsibilities of an infantry soldier were such that he could not be compared with any other category of employee. As regards officers, the Fourth CPC felt that the pay structure should be such that it made the armed forces attractive as a career and provided a reasonable pay progression to the officers of the services.

ARMED FORCES PROPOSALS

Proposals on Principles of Pay Determination

145.7 The Armed Forces have emphasised the aspect of inadequacy of remuneration in the context of the prevailing wage environment in the country. It has been suggested that the recommended structure should enable each member of the Armed Forces to lead life at a standard appropriate to his image and status in society. For determination of pay scales they have suggested that fair and valid comparison with civilians should provide the basis for formulation of pay scales. It has been suggested that the pay scales of Service Officers should in no way be inferior to what the Central Govt. offers to its top most Civil Services. The physical structuring of the pay scales must recognise the difference in the conditions of service between the Armed Forces and the Civil Services. It must take note of the organizational and the cadre structure, career progression and retirement ages on both sides. For PBOR, it has been proposed that norms for structuring of pay scales for Group 'B' and 'C' civilians must also be made applicable to them. The conditions of service such as entry qualifications, promotion, engagement periods etc. also need to be taken into account. Provision of substantial difference for merit and responsibility of higher rank has also been proposed.

Additional Compensation proposed

145.8 The Armed Forces have demanded that there should be adequate additional compensation for the unique conditions of service in the Armed Forces in the form of allowances, compensations and military service pay. The adverse impact of truncated career and the inescapable risk to life have been sought to be compensated. The exacting standards of military discipline and the liability for recall have similarly been identified as features requiring additional compensation. Hardships such as separation from family, unsettled life, high order of physical fitness required, hardships in field areas, are some of the other aspects highlighted by them.

OUR APPROACH TO PAY DETERMINATION

*Existing Package
of Benefits*

145.9 We have examined the proposals made by the Armed Forces in the context of the total package of benefits presently available. We find that for officers, the present pay structure is designed to grant equal compensation for the rank held and total number of years of service rendered, irrespective of the arm or service to which the officer may belong. An edge in the starting pay scale has also been provided vis-a-vis the civilian Group A officers on account of the special and unique conditions of service. Besides, additional compensation is also available in the pay scales, which take into account the pyramidal structure and the constraints of command and control. After the Fourth CPC higher replacement scales as compared to corresponding civilian scales have also been granted. For PBOR, the pay structure is determined on the basis of perceived relativities between occupational groups within the Armed Forces with some relativity being maintained with civilian pay scales. An edge has also been provided to the infantry soldier over the CPO constable. Besides, the deduction on account of 'home savings element' which existed prior to Fourth CPC has been done away with, thereby resulting in higher compensation.

*Additional
Compensation
available*

145.10 As far as compensation for other peculiar features like early retirement, risk to life, hardships and privations is concerned, it has been granted through special concessions and benefits as well as through allowances for particular locational hardships or for risks associated with specific duties. We find that special benefits available uniformly to all officers of the Armed Forces include provision of accommodation, license fee payable at half the rates as compared to civilians, electricity and water charges at half the All India recovery rates, free rations in peace and field areas, weightage in qualifying service for pension and higher percentage of commutation of pension, higher leave entitlement, travel concessions like 'D' Forms which entitle them to travel at 60% of fare, etc. For PBOR, uniform additional compensation for special features is provided through grant of free accommodation, electricity and water, free rations, free uniforms, washing allowance, hair cutting/cleaning allowance, rum and cigarette allowance, annual free warrant for visiting home town, concession vouchers at 50% of fare while travelling at own expense, higher entitlement of leave, pension after 15 years of service, weightage in qualifying service for calculation of pension, higher commutation of pension etc. Reservation of vacancies in Government jobs has also been provided and several schemes for resettlement of ex-servicemen initiated.

*Compensation for
specific hardships*

145.11 In addition to the above compensations which are not generally available to civilian employees, for specific hardships and hazards associated with place of posting, field allowances have been provided and for risky nature of jobs such as flying, duty on submarines, paratrooping, diving, etc. special allowances have been granted.

*Our General
approach*

145.12 We have gone into the issue of determination of the salary structure keeping in view the proposals made by the Armed Forces. Government being the employer for both civilian employees and Armed Forces personnel, our major concern has been to provide just and equitable compensation to both the categories with no category of employee remunerated incongruously high or low. While our approach to adequacy of remuneration, the impact of inflation and socio-economic changes including the effect of private sector salaries has already been

outlined in our general chapter on principles of pay determination after taking into account the proposals made by Armed Forces personnel the examination of duties and responsibilities of service personnel and their distinctive conditions of service merit separate appraisal.

*Comparison with
Civilians*

145 13 We have studied and seen for ourselves the conditions under which Servicemen operate, the complexity of weaponry they are required to handle and the nature of duties and responsibilities they have to carry out. We feel that the nature of duties and the organisational and hierarchical structure of the Armed Forces is such that no direct one to one equation with civilians can be established. Grant of identical pay scales to civilians and service personnel may also not be feasible in view of the distinct differences in rank structure and conditions of service. **The pay structure is, therefore, required to be evolved on the basis of broad comparability with civilian pay scales so as to ensure that the scheme of remuneration for the two categories is not very dissimilar.** This is particularly relevant if we expect recruitment from the same pool of manpower for the Government as a whole.

*Additional
Compensation in
Pay Structure*

145 14 Having established this broad principle, in our opinion, some distinctive features of military life should find compensation in the pay structure itself. We have carefully considered this aspect and feel that the most prominent feature of service in Armed Forces is the requirement of young and physically fit personnel which results in shorter terms of engagement as compared to civilians. We feel that in view of the nature of duties carried out by the Services, any compromise on this requirement would have a deleterious impact. Secondly, the organisation is structured in such a manner that a large proportion of jobs are accounted for at lower levels, thereby preventing career progression in the manner available to civilian employees. Thirdly, there is an element of risk and turbulence which is inherent in service life. In our opinion, the steps taken to counter the constraints of cadre structure should find reflection in the pay scales itself and the aspect of turbulence and extra risk which is distinct from the nature of job of the civilians should similarly be apparent. **We also feel that reasonable pay progression should be provided by delinking the progression from availability of vacancies both in the case of officers and PBOR.** We have therefore formulated a scheme of assured career progression for these personnel also, which has been discussed under the relevant chapters. We have also kept these broad principles in mind while formulating the pay scales.

*Compensation
other than in Pay*

145 15 We generally agree with the approach followed by the Third CPC that an 'all inclusive salary' may not be workable in the Indian context in view of the numerous concessions in kind and allowances available to service personnel. Besides, provision of food, accommodation and clothing in kind also insulates these personnel from inflationary trends. In view of this, our general approach is that the existing concessions on accommodation, electricity and water charges, travel and leave concessions and benefits granted in pensions should continue to be uniformly applicable to all personnel in view of the unique conditions of service. However, we have suggested some rationalisation of certain commonly available allowances. We have also recommended that specially hazardous nature of duties and hardships not common to all and occasioned either due to nature of deployment or specific type of job may be continued to be compensated in the form of separate allowances as at present. For service in field areas distinctly higher compensation for the specific duration of such employment should be available, for

which reason we have substantially raised the rates of such allowances. In addition, to cover the contingency of death during operations, compensation in terms of ex-gratia awards has also suggested.

MILITARY SERVICE PAY

*Services'
Proposals*

145.16 The Armed Forces have suggested that the disadvantages of service life such as risk to life and limb, turbulence and trauma, commitment and dedication to service justify the introduction of an additional element in their salary. They have therefore proposed grant of a military service pay to service personnel.

*Our
recommendations*

145.17 We have examined the issue in the context of the existing compensations available to service personnel and feel that grant of military service pay would imply that the special features of military life be compensated by grant of a single identifiable element. We have already listed the additional benefits which are available to service personnel and feel that their replacement by a separate Military Service pay would be to the detriment of the Armed Forces. In view of this and keeping in view the possible repercussions on other categories of employees engaged in onerous nature of duties or in specialised jobs, we do not recommend grant of military service pay. However, **we have recommended continuance of all the existing concessions and have also recommended an edge in the starting scale to compensate for the special features of military life.**

Pay Structure: Personnel Below Officer Rank

INTRODUCTION

General

146.1 The pay structure of PBOR in the Armed Forces has been devised keeping in view the nature of military employment and combat requirements of command and control which necessitate a sharp pyramidal organization so as to ensure a youthful profile. These compulsions have the impact of restricting career growth and lead to early discharge of personnel. Increasing complexity of modern warfare and induction of sophisticated equipment and weapons are accompanied with the process of upgradation of skills and appropriate classification of PBOR. Keeping in view these considerations, PBOR of the Armed Forces are remunerated according to trade groups which represent varying skill requirements.

RECRUITMENT AND TRAINING

Recruitment

146.2 While recruitment of PBOR in the Army and Navy has been clubbed together, and is made by Zonal Recruiting Offices and Branch Recruiting Offices, recruitment of airmen in the Air Force is carried out separately through the Central Airmen Selection Board and its branches. Keeping in view the service requirements, the general age of recruitment of PBOR is between 17 to 27 years. With the enhancement of recruitment qualifications of combat trades in the Army to matriculation, bulk of the personnel are matric recruits, although higher qualifications are also prescribed where required. We find that specific trade qualifications are not generally insisted upon at the time of recruitment, but are provided in-house

Position on Intake

146.3 We understand that there has been no serious shortfall in recruitment in the case of Army PBOR. It has however been pointed out that shortages exist in the Navy, particularly in the artificer cadre, due to high level of

skills required and better job opportunities in the civil market. Problems are also experienced in the retention of sailors after initial engagement in view of the considerable expansion of shipping and other services consequent on liberalisation of the economy. Lack of volunteers for the submarine and marine commando cadre has also been reported. The problem of retention of trained manpower has been expressed as a common one by the three services.

*Training
Pattern in
Army, Navy
and Air
Force*

146.4 Examining the pattern of training, we find that training is divided into phases consisting of general service training followed by professional and specialised training in trades. Various professional and promotional courses are included as part of inservice training at various stages in the career. The duration of training varies from 6 months to 2 years, depending on the requirement.

RANK AND GROUP STRUCTURE

*Equivalence
of Ranks*

146.5 The existing authorised strength of PBOR in the Army is 9,98,000 personnel, in the Navy it is 45197 men and in the Air Force it is 1,19,940 men. Each service has its own rank structure and for interservice comparisons the following equivalence of ranks is adopted:

RANK STRUCTURE

Army	% of posts	Navy	Air Force
Sub Maj	(0.45)	MCPO I (2.93)	MWO (2.24)
Sub	(3.06)	MCPO II (4.72)	WPO (4.30)
Nb/Sub	(3.45)	CPO (8.78)	JWO (9.80)
Hav	(18.26)	PO (23.65)	Sgt (28.64)
Naik	(18.78)	LS (50.92)	Cpl (35.60)
Sepoy	(56.00)	Sea I	LAC
		Sea II	AC (19.42)

*Trade
Distribution*

146.6 PBOR in the Armed Forces are presently paid on the basis of the group pay system. In the Army, there are 205 trades, in Air Force there are 43 trades while the Navy has 50 trades. These trades are grouped into 5 pay groups in the Army, 4 in the Navy and 4 in the Air Force. Each group follows the same rank structure but has a different pay structure, although there are number of common pay scales. In the Army, at the time of entry into service, every soldier according to entry qualification and tests is allotted a trade from one of the categories, viz., Soldier (General Duty), Soldier (Technical), Soldier (Clerk/Skilled Tradesman) and Soldier (Tradesman). Subsequently, based on aptitude, choice and vacancies, as an inhouse exercise, 'Trade Allocation Group' in various Arms allocates one of the trades. Till the period that the training is completed and the soldier allotted to his particular group, he draws recruits pay which is based on entry qualifications. A similar pattern exists for the Navy and Air Force also.

*Army Trade
Groups*

146.7 There are differences in the entry qualifications, training periods, terms of engagement, qualifying service for promotions etc. for PBOR in the three

services. In the Army the Group A comprises artificers, gunnery instructors, etc and consists mainly of trades remustered from other groups, Group B includes the clerks, storekeepers, artisans who join as matriculates, Group C comprises armourers, vehicle mechanics and operators who are also matriculates. Group 'D' has the largest concentration of personnel and includes the combat trades including the infantry soldier, specialist drivers and except for 6 trades, the rest are matriculate trades. The infantry soldier who is in Group 'D' has been considered as the nodal point to establish relativities with civilian employees. Group 'E' is the non-matric group comprising drivers, cooks and erstwhile non-combated groups. However, a few matric-entry trades also find a place in this Group.

*Groups in the
Air Force*

146.8 In the Air Force, Group I consists of highly skilled technical trades, most of whom are directly recruited with qualifications of 10+2 with Physics, Chemistry and Mathematics as compulsory subjects. Group II has technicians, meteorological assistants, education instructors etc. consisting matriculates with some prescription on minimum marks. Group III has matriculates employed as clerks, storekeepers, medical assistants etc, and Group IV has general duty aircraft hands, drivers, catering assistants etc., with the only non-matric trade being that of a musician.

*Groups in
Navy*

146.9 The Navy has basically three types of entry-the diploma entry, who are recruited as artificers in Group A; the matric entry like submarine and aviation personnel in the Special Group and the seamen, electrical mechanics, radio operators and other trades in Group B, and the non-matric entry consisting of cooks, stewards, musicians etc. in Group 'C'. In addition, there is an Apprentice Entry Scheme under which matriculates with mathematics and general science as subjects are recruited through an All India Examination for induction into the Artificer Cadre.

*Relaxation in
Recruiting
Standards*

146.10 Recruiting rules provide for relaxation in respect of educational and physical standards to the candidates from certain specified backward, remote, border, hilly and tribal regions to give them due representation in the Army. Relaxation in physical standards is also given to one son and one grandson each of serving soldiers, ex-Servicemen and widows of battle casualties.

*Equivalence
of Trades*

146.11 The maximum concentration of personnel in the Army is in Group 'D', in the Navy in Group 'B' and in the Air Force in Group I. The table below indicates the equivalence of the trade groups among the services and percentage of population in the trade groups:

ARMY			TRADE STRUCTURE					
			NAVY			AIR FORCE		
Gp.No.of	% of		Gp. No.of	% of		Gp. No.of	% of	
trades	Popu-		trades	Popu-		trades	Popu-	
lation			lation			lation		
-	-	-	A	10	12	I	18	46.8
A	23	0.9	Spl	19	18	II	12	13.7
B	52	12.0	B	16	60	III	9	27.5
C	41	9.1	-	-	-	-	-	-
D	60	54.5	C	5	10	IV	4	12.0
E	29	23.5	-	-	-	-	-	-

TERMS OF ENGAGEMENT

*Existing
Position*

146.12 The requirement of physical fitness and the sharp pyramidal organizational structure has resulted in imposition of the concept of initial engagement extendable in short steps, which results in differential ages of retirement. The terms of engagement of personnel in the three services are based on the specific requirement of personnel in the three services. In the Army, the initial terms of engagement for Sepoys of the general category is 17 years with a reserve liability of 2 years and for technical trades it is 20 years with a reserve liability of 3 years. Terms of engagement for Naiks, Havildars, Naib Subedars and Subedars are 22 years, 24 years, 26 years and 28 years respectively. In the case of Subedar Majors, the terms are 32 years of service or 4 years service in the rank whichever is earlier. In addition, these terms of engagement are further subject to prescribed age limits which vary from 40 years for the lower ranks to 52 years for Subedar Majors. In the Air Force, the period of initial engagement is 20 years followed by a six-year extension and further extensions of three years at a time. Superannuation is at 55 years for all ranks but airmen who do not obtain the rank of Corporal within 15 years are discharged from service. The Navy initially engages personnel for 15 years and thereafter service is extended in steps of 5 years with Leading Seamen serving for 25 years, Chief Petty Officers and Petty Officers serving till 50 years of age and Master Chiefs serving upto 55 years of age.

PROMOTION PROSPECTS

*Career
Progression*

146.13 The percentage of posts available in various ranks has already been illustrated in the table on Rank Structure. We have also been informed that there is considerable variation in the career progression in the three services as well as across trades in the same service. In the Air Force and the Navy, promotions upto the rank of Corporal and Leading Seaman are by time scale, subject to passing of prescribed examinations. In the Army, all promotions are by selection and based on vacancies in view of the distinct nature of the role of each rank in a combat situation. However, there is also a requirement of passing trade tests. Promotions for PBOR are, therefore, highly competitive and avenues for career progression limited. It has been brought out that in the Army, due to organizational constraints a large percentage of soldiers do not achieve even the first rung of promotion to Naiks and the overall percentage of superseded personnel at any point of time is 37.10%. The actual time taken for promotions is also stated to be much above the minimum eligibility period required for promotion and a great deal of variation in time taken for promotion exists between trade groups.

*Promotion
Prospects in
Air Force*

146.14 In the Air Force, after completion of training and passing of trade test, an airman is posted to the unit as Aircraftsman. There is also provision for direct reclassification to Leading Aircraftsman (LAC). Promotion above Corporal upto Junior Warrant Officer is subject to passing trade/educational tests and availability of vacancies. Promotion above JWO is on the basis of fitness, merit and availability of vacancies. It has been brought out that there is wide variation between actual time taken for promotion and the eligibility period and while the eligibility for promotion to JWO is 12 years, actual time taken varies between 16 - 31 years. Similar time lag exists for promotion to higher ranks also.

146.15 With regard to promotion prospects, the Navy has also brought out that in the Artificer cadre promotion to Chief Artificer takes 7-9 years, against the stipulated 7 years, and some delay takes place on promotion from Chief Artificer to MCPO-I also. In the non-artificer cadre, available data indicates that promotion to the rank of Petty Officer takes 10-12 years, against the eligibility of 7 years service and promotion to MCPO-I takes on an average 26 years of service against the eligibility of 16 years.

ARMED FORCES PROPOSALS ON PAY STRUCTURE

146.16 It has been stated by the Armed Forces that the problems arising due to the constraints of the cadre structure which require attention are the truncated nature of the career, the long time taken for promotions vis-a-vis the stipulated eligibility period, differences in career progression between trades and from service to service, and the problem of retention of highly skilled personnel in view of opportunities in other sectors. While no change in the cadre structure itself has been suggested, the problem of variable progression of trades is sought to be resolved by evolving a suitable pay structure and running integrated pay scales have therefore been suggested so as to ensure that on attaining the same rank even at different lengths of service, personnel coming together at that point of time draw the same pay.

146.17 It has also been suggested that unlike the single point linkage of infantry soldier with industrial worker, the linkage should be established at various cardinal points throughout the career progression and pay determined on point to point basis giving due weightage to combat and leadership skills, medical fitness requirements etc.

146.18 The Armed Forces have urged that the pay structure should be evolved on entry qualifications as applicable to Civilian Central Govt. employees. It has been suggested that the pay scales for matric entry should be the main scale for the purpose of relativity. Where the entry qualifications are a Diploma in technical subject/Engg. or in-service training is recognised as a Diploma/equivalent qualification or for graduate entry, pay scales should be equated to scales with the same entry qualification in Central Govt. Two separate integrated scales of pay, one from Sepoy to Havildar and another for JCOs have been recommended for both diploma entry and matric entry soldiers. For non matric entry, a pay scale covering 3 years and ultimately meeting the integrated pay scale for matric entry personnel has been proposed.

We have considered the various suggestions made by the Armed Forces in the succeeding paragraphs.

REVIEW OF TERMS OF ENGAGEMENT

146.19 We have earlier in the Chapter indicated the existing terms of engagement of PBOR of the three services. In order to overcome the problems created by a truncated career, the Armed Forces have suggested a review of the terms of engagement of Army personnel to meet the dual objectives of maintaining

a youthful profile and providing a fuller career. We have dealt with this proposal in our Chapter on optimising the size of the Armed Forces and recommendations made therein will apply.

DELINKING OF TRADE STRUCTURE FROM PAY STRUCTURE

*Services
Proposal*

146.20 At present remuneration for PBOR is linked to the trade group they belong to and the pattern of progression and pay scales available to that trade group. It has been suggested that the pay structure should be delinked from the trade structure in view of the inherent disadvantages of variable progression and the need for compensation for leadership and combat skills.

*Background of
Trade Groups*

146.21 We have gone into the issue and find that the existing structure based on trade groups has evolved over a period of time. The Post-War Pay Committee grouped the then trades into 8 groups of the Army, 5 groups of the Air Force and 4 groups of the Navy. The Third CPC considered the issue of classification of trades in the context of the Armed Forces' demand to equate the infantry soldier with the skilled worker. They took note of the technological changes both in the factories and workshops as well in the infantryman's role, which demanded higher technological knowledge due to increasing complexity of weapons over the years. In the case of infantry soldiers and several service trades, no formal pre-entry qualifications were prescribed and fairly intensive in-service training had to be imparted to recruits. Keeping all these factors in view they felt it would be more appropriate to place the infantry soldier between a semi-skilled and a skilled workman. Infantry soldiers who were in Group F as a result of this reclassification got elevated to Group D. They also considered that the Group E soldiers had passed trade tests after induction as semi-skilled workers and in view of the small pay differential between Group E & F, they were also elevated to Group D. No change was made to the Navy groups and for the Air Force, Groups III and IV were merged. The Third CPC also considered that a further reduction of pay groups would be difficult, as such a measure could only follow comprehensive job evaluation studies.

*Fourth CPC's
Recommend-
ations*

146.22 On the issue of reclassification of existing trades, the Fourth Pay Commission recommended that cases of dissimilar remuneration for similar trades may be examined by the Army Trade Qualification Committee (ATQC) or any other expert body to bring about uniformity. Until then they suggested that the existing pay groups in the three services may continue with the present distribution of trades in these groups.

*Our Recommen-
dations*

146.23 We have studied the existing distribution of trades and find that there are disparities in the pattern of grouping and remuneration of seemingly identical trades in the three services. There is also no uniformity in the educational qualifications prescribed for a particular trade group. We find that reallocation of trades on achieving either higher qualifications or on improvement of skills has been an ongoing exercise in the Armed Forces. Considering all the relevant factors we are of the opinion that without a comprehensive exercise to group trades on an inter-service basis based on skills, it may not be possible to do away with the trade groupings related pay structure. The Ministry of Defence arc

also not in favour of doing away with the existing structure without a trade rationalisation exercise, since the existing trade groups indicate functional requirements and abolition of this old age system may lead to inter/intra service dissatisfaction. We observe that although the Armed Forces in their memorandum have arrived at a common approach regarding a uniform structure, the proposals are not based on any job evaluation as such but are basically based on consensus. The Armed Forces have also contended that every job in the Armed Forces has the components of a) Combat element b) Trade element c) Sub-cadre element and d) Leadership element and that successive Pay Commissions have only looked at the trade element for comparison and ignored other elements. While we are not in agreement with the contention that other elements have not been considered, we agree that combat and leadership elements are important components of service jobs and unless the trades are evaluated and a weightage given for each of these elements, it may not be possible to arrive at a rational structure based solely on entry qualifications nor is it possible to establish interservice equations. It is relevant to mention here that civilian industrial trades in the Ministry of Defence were also classified on the basis of a point rating system by an Expert Classification Committee. In view of these factors, we do not recommend any change in the present system of trade groups based pay structure. However we consider that appropriate weightage to combat and leadership skills must be given and recommend setting up of an Inter Services Committee to evolve a system of rating of skills and classifying trades on a point rating system so that the pay structure could be rationalised. This would enable a more rational approach towards grant of common pay to the three Services and subsequent to the trade rationalisation exercise, a common pay structure for the three services can be devised. We also feel that the pay of the Group 'D' infantry soldier of the Army requires some upgradation especially keeping in view the recruitment qualification of matriculation. We therefore suggest that personnel in Group 'D' of the Army may be paid as per Group 'C' pay scales without changing the existing system of trade groups.

<p>PROBLEM OF STAGNATION AND DIFFERENCE IN TIME TAKEN FOR PROMOTIONS</p>

Our Approach

146.24 We have already indicated the variation between the actual time taken for promotions and the prescribed eligibility periods for such promotions. While we have suggested setting up of a Committee in order to evaluate and group comparable trades, we feel that the problem of stagnation and variable progression across trades are also required to be addressed separately by us. In this context, the Armed Forces have suggested that time scale promotion to the rank of Naik be granted in the Army after 10 years of service in order to achieve some measure of inter-service parity. While we feel that promotion to higher ranks in the Armed Forces can only be based on functional justification in view of the organisational structure and command and control requirements, and certain differences are inescapable, delinking of promotion from availability of vacancies by providing financial benefit of promotion without concurrently granting the rank or functional promotion could be justified. We also find that the maximum variation in promotion time between trade groups exists in the Army and in the Air Force and Navy promotions upto the rank of Corporal and equivalent are by time-scale. For promotions above that rank in the Navy and Air Force, variations between trades

and branches are not as significant as in the case of the Army, except for promotion from Sgt. to Junior Warrant officers in the Air Force. Therefore, while we are not in favour of substantive time scale promotion to the rank of Naik in the Army in view of the distinct level of responsibility shouldered by Naiks and in view of the existing differentials in the terms of engagements of Sepoys and Naiks, we feel that financial upgradation could be granted. For civilian employees, we have already suggested a scheme of assured career progression whereby the next higher scale in the hierarchy would be granted after prescribed number of years subject to fitness to be determined by a screening board. For Personnel Below Officer Rank of the Armed Forces also we recommend that the ACP upgradation to the scale of Naik and equivalent may be granted after 10 years of service and the second ACP upgradation to the scale of Havildar and equivalent may be granted after 20 years of service. The second ACP would therefore be available to those who have been granted substantive promotion to the rank of Naik and equivalent. In our opinion, this method would render greater benefits in pay and pension and would also take care of the differences in promotion time to some extent.

LINKAGE WITH CIVILIANS

Background

146.25 On the issue of relativity with civilians, we find that prior to the Fourth CPC a single point linkage was established between the industrial worker and the Group 'D' infantry soldier. The Post-War Pay Committee had equated the infantry soldier with three years' service after training with the semi-skilled worker. The Third CPC considered the issue of relativity in detail and while they were doubtful if any specific equations could be established between the Serviceman and civilians, in view of the progress in technology and taking note of entry qualifications, they suggested that the infantry soldier be placed between the 'Semi-skilled' and 'skilled' workman. They, therefore, based their recommendations about the pay of the soldier on the pay granted to such workmen, added an 'X' factor element for the disadvantages inherent in service life and made deductions on account of the home savings element, finally arriving at a pay scale of Rs. 175-2-195 for the infantry Sepoy. The scale finally granted by the Government was Rs. 200-5-260 which gave the soldier an edge over the CPO constable. The Fourth CPC had averred that the nature of duties of infantry soldiers was such that he could not really be compared with any other category of employee. We find that the pay finally granted after the Fourth CPC not only did away with the deduction on account of the home-savings element, but has been formulated in a manner to provide an edge after 3 years' service over the skilled worker.

Our recommendations

146.26 We find that the existing scale of pay of the infantry soldier is Rs. 900-15-960-20-1120 and he actually starts at Rs. 930 in the scale. We have gone into the issue of comparisons and after witnessing for ourselves the multifarious nature of duties carried out by infantry soldiers are inclined to agree with the Fourth CPC that the duties and responsibilities of infantry soldiers are not really comparable with any other category of employee. As regards comparison at other levels, there are substantial differences in the rank and cadre structure of service personnel and civilians which cannot really be reconciled. A point to point comparison is therefore not possible unless a scientific enquiry in the form of job evaluation is undertaken. We have already suggested setting up of an Inter-Service Committee to rate skills and classify service trades. However, in the existing scenario, we feel that the personnel in the Central Police Organizations such as the

BSF are required to carry out duties which could perhaps be categorised as broadly similar to the Armed Forces, although the job of an infantry soldier definitely is more demanding. However, we have in doing so not suggested any change if the existing relation-ship with the skilled worker as established by the Fourth CPC in the pay scales recommended by them. We, therefore, suggest that the infantry soldier may continue to have an edge at the start over the CPO Constable. In view of this, we have suggested a starting pay of Rs.3000 for the infantry soldier vis-a-vis Rs.2860 suggested for the CPO constable.

PAY STRUCTURE AND ENTRY QUALIFICATIONS

Our Views

146.27 With regard to the demand that the pay structure be devised on the basis of entry qualifications, we agree that the pay structure can be evolved on the basis of entry qualifications to the extent of linkage with the minimum pay scale fixed for a particular educational qualification on the civilian side. We have kept this in mind while suggesting matriculate and non-matric salaries for Armed Forces personnel. As far as the diploma entry are concerned, it is seen that in majority of cases in the Armed Forces, diploma equivalent qualifications are acquired in service and at Government expense. We find that the exact position in this regard is as follows:

- a) In the Air Force, the recruitment qualifications for the Gp I trades which are Diploma trades are 10 + 2 with Physics Chemistry and Maths, and training is provided in house. Out of 18 trades in this group, 10 trades have been equated to Diploma in Engineering.
- b) In the Army, most of the Gp A trades which have been stated to be Diploma trades are remustered trades and personnel in these trades do not join with diploma qualifications. There is also a great deal of variation in the residency period in various trades before the diploma qualification is acquired.
- c) It is only in the Artificer cadre of the Navy that there is direct entry of Diploma holders from Polytechnics. These Artificers are recruited in the rank of Acting Artificer Class IV with a pay scale of Rs.1180-1205.

Our Recommendations

146.28 In view of the above, a common approach to diploma trades as suggested by the Armed Forces does not seem possible unless there is uniformity in recruitment qualifications. However, for the matric entry recruit we have suggested a pay scale keeping in mind the scales prescribed for similar qualification on the civil side. As regards Artificers, we have improved their pay scales and in view of their fast progression which enables them to reach a scale of Rs.1880 in a period of 7-9 years, we are unable to grant total parity with civilian diploma holders.

RECOMMENDED PAY SCALES

General

146.29 We have already gone into the various issues concerning the

Approach

formulation of the pay structure of PBOR in the context of the specific demands made by the Armed Forces. Since we have not suggested any change with regard to the trade groups, the existing differences in pay structure are inescapable. Moreover we do not think that differences in progression between trades in the three services can be fully neutralised, functional requirements being different. We are also not convinced if grant of integrated pay scales to PBOR would render any significant benefit in view of their shorter terms of engagement due to which a large proportion of personnel would exit from the system in the middle of the integrated pay scale and would not be able to derive any benefit of integrated scales. In any case, we have recommended that service officers too be brought on to regular scales of pay. In our opinion, the ACP scheme would be more beneficial to PBOR especially keeping in view the fact that their pension would continue to be calculated on the basis of maximum of the pay scales. We have already outlined the ACP scheme which would be available to PBOR of the Armed Forces and this would considerably neutralise the variable progression in trades without any impact on the youthful profile of the Armed Forces.

*Pay Scales
for Army
PBOR*

146.30 Keeping in view all relevant factors and within the overall framework outlined above, we recommend the following pay scales for the personnel below officer rank of the Armed Forces.

<u>ARMY</u>				
<u>Rank</u>	<u>Gp.A</u>	<u>Gp.B</u>	<u>Gp.C and D</u>	<u>Gp.E</u>
Subedar Major	7250-200- 10050	6750-200- 9550	6750-200- 9550	6600-200- 9400
Subedar	6170-175- 8970	5770-155- 8250	5620-155- 8100	5395-155- 7875
Naib Subedar	5200-125- 7450	4800-125- 7050	4650-125- 6900	4400-125- 6650
Havildar	4150-85- 5425	3600-85- 4875	3425-85- 4700	3250-85- 4525
Naik	3700-70- 4750	3250-70- 4300	3150-70- 4200	2975-70- 4025
Sepoy	3500-55- 4160	3050-55- 3875	2945-55- 3825	2900-55- 3725

Sepoys in Group 'C' and 'D' will be granted a starting pay of Rs.3000 in the scale, keeping in view the present position where the Group 'C' starts after one increment.

PAY SCALES OF DSC PERSONNEL

Our Recommendations

146 31 Personnel in the Defence Security Corps (DSC) who are engaged in protecting valuable and strategically important defence installations and depots are presently paid on the basis of Group 'B' and Group 'E' pay scales of the Army applied to the clerical cadre and General Duties cadre respectively. It has been suggested that they may be granted pay scales based on ranks and rank pay may be paid in addition as incentive for merit and responsibility. In our recommendations for PBOR of the Army, we have not made any changes in the present pay structure and the system of remuneration based on trade groups will continue. In view of this, we recommend that DSC personnel belonging to the clerical cadre may be continued to be paid on the basis of Group 'B' pay scales recommended for the Army and the General Duties Cadre may be paid as per the Group 'E' pay scales of the Army.

CLASSIFICATION PAY IN THE ARMY

Existing Scheme and Services Proposal

146 32 The concept of classification pay is applicable to Army personnel only. It is provided as an incentive for improving skills in their respective trades. At present, a soldier must achieve class III, class II and class I level of proficiency for promotion to rank of Naik, Havildar and Naib Subedar respectively. In the context of the integrated pay scales proposed by them, the Armed Forces have suggested that:

- a) Every soldier should attain class 3 level of proficiency in his trade on completion of training.
- b) On attaining class 2 a soldier will be eligible for promotion to Naik which will qualify him for rank pay of Naik.
- c) On attainment of Class 1 level, classification pay of Rs. 100/-per month may be granted.

Existing Rates

146 33 The existing rates of classification pay are as follows:

Group	Existing Rates		
	Class 4 to Class 3	Class 3 to Class 2	Class 2 to Class 1
A	-	Rs.30/-	Rs.30/-
B	Rs.25/-	Rs.25/-	Rs.25/-
C	Rs.20/-	Rs.20/-	Rs.20/-
D	Rs.15/-	Rs.15/-	Rs.15/-
E	-	Rs.10/-	Rs.10/-

Our Recommendations

146 34 We have considered the proposal made by the Armed Forces and since the basic pay structure is not being changed, we recommend that the classification Pay may be renamed as Classification Allowance and the

existing rates may be doubled. However, since common pay scales for Gp 'C' and Group 'D' have been recommended, classification pay for Group 'D' may also be enhanced to Group 'C' levels.

APPOINTMENT PAY IN THE ARMY

*Existing
Position*

146.35 In addition to regular ranks of Naik and Havildar, the Army is authorised certain appointments in peace and war establishments, which are granted incentive for additional responsibility and administrative work. Individuals deployed on these appointments which are available only upto the rank of Havildar, are entitled to Appointment Pay.

*Services'
Proposal*

146.36 It has been suggested that the rates of Appointment Pay may be enhanced to Rs.100/- per month for all appointments presently in receipt of appointment pay. Introduction of appointment pay for some JCO level appointments in the Army and some appointments in Navy and Air Force have also been proposed.

*Our Recommend-
ations*

146.37 We find that appointment pay is granted for appointments other than regular ranks of the Army and is linked to some additional administrative duties to be carried out. Appointment Pay also compensates to an extent for lack of promotion avenues in the Army. Keeping all relevant factors in mind we suggest that the existing appointment pay may be renamed as 'Extra Duty Allowance' and revised as follows:

Appointment	Existing Rate (in Rs. per month)	Revised Rate
1. Lance Naik, Lance Havildar, Coy Havildar, Major, Coy Quarter Master Havildar	24	50
2. Regiment QM/Battalion QM Havildar	36	75
3. Battalion Havildar Major	40	80

*Other
Suggestions*

146.38 We, however, do not recommend extension of Appointment Pay to JCOs since they have already had the benefit of better promotion avenues. We also do not suggest grant of the allowance to Naval and Air Force personnel.

AIR FORCE PAY SCALES

Our Recommendations 146.39 For personnel belonging to the Air Force, who are distributed in four pay groups, we recommend the following pay scales:

	AIR FORCE			
	Group I	Group II	Group III	Group IV
Master Warrant Officer	7400-200-10200	6750-200-9550	6600-200-9400	6600-200-9400
Warrant Officer	6495-175-9295	6170-175-8970	5620-155-8100	5620-155-8100
Junior Warrant Officer	5530-125-7780	5200-125-7450	4650-125-6900	4650-125-6900
Sergeant	4670-85-5945	4320-85-5595	3775-85-5050	3775-85-5050
Corporal	4150-70-5200	3900-70-4950	3320-70-4370	3200-70-4250
Leading Aircraftsman	4025-60-4925	3650-60-4550	3200-60-4100	3080-60-3980
Air Craftsman	3675	3200	3050	2975

PAY STRUCTURE FOR NON-COMBATANTS (ENROLLED)

Existing Position and Demand

146.40 In the Air force, a scheme of enrolling Non-combatants was started in 1968 in view of increasing difficulties experienced in moving Group 'D' civilians to forward air bases. Recruitment is made as lascars, cooks, dhobis, safaiwala, tailors, painters etc. with age limit for entry being 17-35 years and no minimum educational qualification prescribed for recruitment. These NCs(E) who number 9,996 against an authorization of 11,118 are presently in the pay scale of Rs.750-12-870-EB-14-940 and have no promotion avenues. It has been suggested that in order to provide at least two opportunities for career advancement, posts of Tindals may be created in the ratio of one tindal for every 9 NCs(E) and one post of Head Tindal for every 9 Tindals. In order to restrict additional expenditure on account of creation of these posts, surrender of 614 posts of NCs(E) has been proposed.

Recommended Pay Structure

146.41 We have gone into the issue and feel that in view of the ACP scheme suggested by us for Group 'D' employees, higher grades can be provided under the dynamic' ACP Scheme without creation of posts. We therefore suggest that the two higher scales of Rs.775-1025 and Rs.800-1150 may be made available to NCs(E) after 12 and 24 years' service respectively under the provisions of the Assured Career Progression Scheme. However, the proposed

reduction in the establishment to the extent of 614 posts may be implemented, as these posts appear to be surplus to requirement

NAVAL ARTIFICERS-RESTRUCTURING & PAY SCALES

*Present
Position*

146.42 Naval Artificers who constitute Group A of the Navy are highly skilled personnel engaged in maintenance and repair work in the Marine Engineering Branch, Electrical Branch and Naval Aviation Branch. There are two types of entry for Artificers, namely, Apprentice Entry and Direct (Diploma Holder) Entry. For Apprentice Entry, an All-India examination is conducted by the Navy. The educational qualification required for the Apprentice Entry is minimum of matriculation with mathematics and general science as primary subjects. All apprentices are required to undergo a 4-year apprenticeship training. On successful completion of this training, these apprentices are equated to a diploma awarded by a Government Polytechnic and are rated as Artificer V class. At this stage, on-the-job training is granted for another year to enable personnel to be rated as Acting Artificer IV class. Thereafter the sailor is required to appear in departmental examinations in the form of Fleet Boards, which finally clear him for effective manning of ships. This process takes about a year at the end of which the sailor is rated as Artificer IV class equivalent to a Petty Officer.

*Direct Entry
Artificers*

146.43. Under the direct entry artificer scheme, diploma holders in specific disciplines from various Polytechnics are recruited directly by the Navy. These sailors enter the service as Acting, Artificer IV and are thereafter given 18 months training which brings them up to the level of Artificer IV class.

*Equation with
Naval Ranks*

146.44 The Artificers of Navy are graded according to their level of technical competence, experience and responsibility. Each grade in Artificer cadre is equated to a particular service rank, starting from equation of Artificer V Class with Leading Seaman, Acting Art IV Class and Art IV Class with Petty officer and Art III Class, IInd Class, 1st Class and Chief Artificer being equated to Chief Petty Officers. Master Chief Art II Class and Master Chief Art Ist Class are equated to MCPO II and I respectively.

*Equation with
Naval Ranks*

146.45 We understand that Artificers III class, who qualify a specific examination called the "Charge Board", become Chief Artificer, which entitles them to a markedly higher pay scale. Only sailors designated as Chief Artificers are considered for promotion to MCPO II and MCPO I. Artificers II class and I class are those who have not been able to qualify the 'Charge Board' and therefore are not considered for selection to the ranks of MCPO II and I.

*Services'
Proposal*

146.46 The following suggestions with regard to the restructuring of the Artificer cadre have been made by the Armed Forces:

- a) Abolition of Artificer II and Artificer I, as their utility to the service is marginal, especially after the introduction of the ranks of MCPO II & I.
- b) Redesignation of remaining grades on the lines of regular Navy ranks with Artificer II Class and Chief Artificer to continue to

remain equated to Chief Petty Officer, and Acting Art. IV Class to be equated to Acting Petty Officer.

Our Recommendations 146.47 We have gone into the suggestions with regard to restructuring and feel that although there is no need to provide two promotion grades to Artificers III Class who have not qualified 'Charge Board' examination and are not going to assume any higher responsibilities, in view of the existing position where they can attain higher scales, at least one more promotion avenue should remain open for them. **We, therefore, recommend merger of the grades of Artificer II Class and Artificer I Class into a single grade instead of their abolition.**

Proposed Scales 146.48 We also recommend merger of the grades of Acting Artificer IV Class and Artificer IV Class into a single grade of Artificer IV Class as this would provide improvement in the pay scale of diploma holders. In view of this proposed restructuring, we recommend the following revised pay scales for Artificers of the Navy:

ARTIFICERS	
Artificers/Mechanicians (in Rs.)	Proposed Scales (in Rs.)
a) Apprentice 1st year (800)	2650
b) Apprentice 2nd year (825)	2750
c) Apprentice 3rd year (850)	2850
d) Apprentice 4th year (875)	2875
e) Artificer Vth Class (1000-20-1020)	Artificer IVth Class 3200-60-3260
f) Acting Artificer IVth Class) (1180-25-1205)	Artificer IIIrd Class 4150-70-4360
g) Artificer/Mechanician IVth Class) (1300-25-1350)	
h) Artificer/Mechanician IIIrd Class (1425-25-1550-40-2070)	Artificer IIInd Class 4550-100-6350
i) Artificer/Mechanician IIInd Class) (1600-25-1725-40-2085-50-2285))	Artificer Ist Class 5120-100-7120
j) Artificer/Mechanician Ist Class) (1690-25-1815-40-2095-50-2395)	
l) Chief Artificer/Mechanician (1880-40-2080-50-2730)	6000-125-8250

- m) Master Chief Petty Officer II 6495-175-9295
(1930-50-2280-60-2580-75-2955)
- n) Master Chief Petty Officer I 7400-200-10200
(2250-60-2490-75-3240)

For Artificers of the Aviation Cadre, we recommend the following revised pay scales:

Flight Engineer (in Rs.)	Proposed Scales (in Rs.)
a) Aircraft Artificer/Mechanician III (1460-25-1660-40-2080-50-2130)	Artificer/Mechanician II 4675-100-6475
b) Aircraft Artificer/Mechanician II (1645-25-1720-40-2080-50-2400)	Artificer/Mechanician I 5250-100-7250
c) Aircraft Artificer/Mechanician I (1700-25-1850-40-2050-50-2400)	
d) Chief Aircraft Artificer/Mechanician (1920-40-2080-50-2780)	6150-125-8400
e) Master Chief Aircraft Artificer Mechanician II (1930-50-2280-60-2580-75-2955)	6495-175-9295
f) Master Chief Aircraft Artificer Mechanician I (2250-50-2490-75-3240)	7400-200-10200

With regard to pay scales of flight signallers in the Navy, we recommend that they may continue to be paid on the basis of Group I scales of the Air Force as per the existing relativities.

PAY SCALES OF OTHER NAVAL PERSONNEL

Recommended Pay Scales 146.49 With regard to other naval personnel, we recommend the following pay scales:

NAVY			
	Special Group Aviation/Submarine	Group B	Group C
Master Chief Petty Officer I	6750-200-9550	6600-200-9400	6600-200-9400
Master Chief Petty Officer II	6170-175-8970	5620-155-8100	5620-155-8100
Chief Petty Officer	5200-125-7450	4650-125-6900	4650-125-6900
Petty Officer	4320-85-5595	3775-85-5050	3775-85-5050

Leading Seaman	3900-70-4950	3320-70-4370	3200-70-4250
Seaman I	3650-60-4550	3200-60-4100	3080-60-3980
Seaman II	3325-60-3445	3080-60-3200	2865-55-3140

The Seaman II in Gp. C may, however, be granted the starting pay of Rs.2975/-.

PAY OF RECRUITS

*Services
Proposal*

146.50 As the service of a soldier is counted from the day of enrolment, the Armed Forces have proposed to make the proposed integrated pay scale applicable to him from the recruits stage itself. It has been suggested that this would ensure parity with the civil side where a person starts drawing the pay of his scale from joining and skills are acquired on the job itself.

Our Recommendations

146.51 Since we have not recommended any change in the basic pay structure of Armed Forces personnel and since the trade group is allotted after training, recruits cannot be granted the pay of the rank and group. In view of this, we suggest the following replacement scales for recruits in the Armed Forces:

	Existing	Proposed
	(Rs. p.m)	
Army		
Matric entry	850	2850
Normal entry	750	2440
Navy		
Avn/Sub Gp	1000	3200
Gp. B	900	2900
Gp. C	825	2750
Air Force		
Gp. I,II & III	850	2850
Gp. IV	800	2650

STATUS OF JCOS

Demand

146.52 The Armed Forces have proposed that in view of the important functional role of JCOs and equivalent they should be granted financial and administrative powers at par with Group 'B' gazetted officers in the Central Government. They also recommend that their pay should not only find parity with Gp. B Gazetted Civilian Officers, but have an edge in view of the unique characteristics of military service.

Our Recommendations

146.53 The system of Groups is proposed to be done away with for civilians and the gazetted/non-gazetted classification is also proposed to be abolished. In view of this, we are unable to consider the demand

PAY SCALES OF HONORARY COMMISSIONED OFFICERS

Recommended Pay Structure

146.54 Serving JCOs and equivalent of the Armed Forces, who have rendered specially distinguished service, are granted commissions in the last year of service as Honorary officers in the rank of Captain or Lieutenants by the Service Chiefs. The grant of Honorary Commission entitles these personnel to higher pay. It has been suggested that these personnel may be granted enhanced pay and military service and rank pay in addition.

146.55 We have considered the existing terms and conditions of grant of Honorary Commission and recommend the following revised pay for these personnel:

	Existing Pay	Revised Pay
	(Rs. per month)	
1. Honorary Lieutenant & Equiv	3300	10500
2. Honorary Captain & Equiv.	3400	10850

PROVISION RELATING TO ACTING PROMOTION

Present Position

146.56 The Armed forces have a system of granting acting ranks to Junior Commissioned Officers and Non Commissioned Officers to fill the vacancies in authorised establishment. The acting rank remains unpaid until an unbroken period of 28 days has been served in that rank. After completion of this period, the unpaid acting rank is converted into a paid acting rank and the pay is admissible with retrospective effect.

Demand

146.57 The Armed Forces have demanded that the condition of holding unpaid acting rank for 28 consecutive days for NCOs and JCOs should be abolished and the paid acting rank should be effective from the date of assumption of the rank.

Our Recommendations

146.58 We have considered the suggestion and since the paid acting rank is granted with retrospective effect, we do not recommend any change. Besides, there is a logic in ensuring that a reasonable period is spent in the rank before it is converted into a paid rank.

Pay Structure - Officers

INTRODUCTION

General

147.1 The imperatives of a youthful profile and high standard of physical fitness which govern the recruitment of PBOR are equally applicable to the officer cadre of the Armed Forces. Due to the command and rank oriented nature of the officer cadre, a major proportion of jobs are accounted for by the junior and middle levels. The cadre strengths in turn are based on force levels required to fulfil operational and support roles. However, unlike the PBOR, officers of the Armed Forces are paid on the basis of common pay scales for the three services.

RANK STRUCTURE

*Existing
Position*

147.2 The existing authorised strength of service officers and the equivalence of ranks in the three services is indicated below:

Army		Navy		Air Force	
Rank	Strength	Rank	Strength	Rank	Strength
General	1	Admiral	1	Air Chief Marshal	01
Lt.General	57	Vice Admiral)		Air	23
)	52	Marshal	
Maj. Gen	196	Rear Admiral)		Air Vice Marshal	48

Army		Navy		Air Force	
Rank	Strength	Rank	Strength	Rank	Strength
Brigadier	796	Cmde	371	Air Cmde	152
Colonel	3310	Captain		Group Captain	587
Lt. Col.	3794	Commander	1191	Wing Commander	1791
Major	13889	Lt. Commander and Below	5577	Sqn. Leader	3645
Capt. & Subaltern	22604			Flt. Lt. & Below	4622
Total	44643		7192		10869

CADRE CONFIGURATION

*Officer
Cadre of
Army*

147.3 In the Army, the Artillery, Mechanised Infantry, Infantry, Engineers, Signals and Army Aviation Corps comprise the arms or the fighting elements. The Army Service Corps, Army Ordnance Corps, Corps of Electrical and Mechanical Engineers, Army Postal Service Corps and the Pioneer Corps comprise the logistic support and maintenance element, while Intelligence Corps, Army Medical Corps, Army Dental Corps, Military Nursing Service, Remount and Veterinary Corps, Army Education Corps, Judge Advocate General's Branch, Army Physical Training Corps, Corps of Military Police and Military Farms comprise the specialist cadres.

*Officer
Cadre of
the Navy*

147.4 The Navy has a General List Cadre, which includes officers of all branches, namely, Executive, Engineering, Electrical and Education. In addition, there is the Special Duties List comprising officers promoted from the ranks. The General List cadre has two distinct special cadres superimposed, namely, the Aviation and Submarine cadres.

*Officer
Cadre of
the Air Force*

147.5 The Officer cadre in the IAF consists of Flying Branch and Ground Duties Branches. The Ground Duties Branches comprise the technical branch, administrative branch, logistics branch, accounts branch, meteorological branch, education branch etc.

RECRUITMENT

*Entry into
Armed Forces*

147.6 Recruitment to the Armed Forces is done mainly through the UPSC. The UPSC holds an all India competitive examination, known as the Combined

Defence Services Examination (CDSE), twice a year. University graduates are eligible to take this examination and the qualified candidates join the respective training academies, namely the Indian Military Academy (IMA) for the Army, the Naval Academy for the Navy and the Air Force Academy for the Air Force. The UPSC also holds, twice a year, an examination for entry into the National Defence Academy (NDA). Candidates on completion of 10+2 Examination are eligible to take this examination. The successful candidates join the NDA and on completion of the NDA Course are sent to the respective Service Academies for their pre-commission training. For Technical Branches as well as Law and certain other branches, the recruitment is made directly through the Services Selection Boards in the case of the Army and the Navy, and through the Air Force Selection Board for the Air Force.

*AMC and
AIX*

147.7 Entry to the Army Medical Corps is through the Armed Forces' Medical College in case of Permanent Commission Officers and from the open market for Short Service Commission Officers. All entrants to the Army Dental Corps come from civil institutions after completing BDS Course and a one-year internship course from dental colleges.

Other Schemes

147.8 All the three services have schemes of promoting personnel from the ranks. In addition, a scheme to grant Short Service Commission for a period of 5 years, extendable to 10 years, also exists. Since 1992, induction of women in specified Arms and Services on Short Service Commission basis has been started.

TRAINING

*Existing
Position*

147.9 For NDA/Naval Academy cadets, the training covers 3 years after which the 10+2 entry cadets are granted a graduation degree in Humanities/ Science/Engineering (for 10+2 technical entry in the Navy). These cadets are not entitled to any emoluments during this period of training. All graduates from NDA/Naval Academy along with Direct entry graduate recruits undergo a 12-month training (18 months for Direct Entry) at the Indian Military Academy/Air Force Academy in the case of Army and Air Force and at sea in the case of the Navy. During this period of training, no pay is admissible but during last six months of this training a stipend is paid. These Cadets/Midshipmen are granted Commission and are entitled to their first pay and allowances only on successful completion of their training. However, Technical Graduates, Meteorological Branch Officers of Air Force, certain specialised categories like Law and Short Service Commission Officers of the Army and Navy are granted commission into the service from the date of joining.

POSITION OF INTAKE AND PROMOTION PROSPECTS

*Position on
Intake*

147.10 The Armed Forces have emphasized before us the aspect of shortfall in the intake of officers. The Army has specifically mentioned the constraints due to the shortage of over 12000 officers. Specific data on annual planned and actual intake under the various entry schemes has also been provided to us. We have

already highlighted the aspect of shortage in our chapter on the Morale and Quality of service personnel. We are given to understand that the Armed Forces are facing considerable problems due to decline in the quality of intake and lack of optants for the fighting arms. It has been stated that due to poor compensation for highly disturbed and turbulent life, the number of officers seeking premature retirement is increasing. The poor attractiveness of the Short Service Commission is also cited as one of the major concerns.

*Promotion
Prospects*

147.11 Promotion upto the rank of Major and equivalent are time based and subject to qualifying the prescribed examinations. Promotion to higher ranks is by selection and depends on the number of available vacancies. We have been informed that the scope for advancement in select ranks is limited due to the command and control structure. It has been stated that the distribution of posts in the Armed Forces is such that 92.2% of posts are accounted for upto the rank of Lt. Col and equivalent. The percentage of posts at higher levels has been stated to be as follows:

	Upto Lt.Col.& Equivalent	Col/Brig.& Equivalent	Maj Gen.& Equivalent	Lt Gen.& Equivalent
Army	90.4	9.1	0.4	0.16
Navy	93.7	5.4	0.49	0.24
Air Force	92.2	7.1	0.5	0.2

Comparisons have been drawn with the percentages available to the civil services. However, it has been urged that cadre reviews in the Armed Forces are likely to create imbalances and run contrary to the requirement of maintaining a youthful profile as well as lead to dilution of ranks. One of the known fallouts of cadre reviews carried out in the past has been to increase the average age of battalion commanders, which has a direct bearing on the fighting efficiency of the Armed Forces.

EXISTING PAY STRUCTURE

*Present
Position*

147.12 Armed Forces officers upto the rank of Brigadier are presently paid on the basis of an integrated pay scale introduced on the recommendations of the Fourth CPC so as to provide reasonable career progression to service officers. To compensate for ranks attained, rank pay is also granted which attracts dearness allowance and is reckoned for pensionary benefits. The integrated pay scale has a fixed minimum pay for each rank linked to number of years taken to achieve such rank. The resultant effect is that personnel belonging to a particular rank with equal number of years of service are remunerated equally. Major Generals and above and their equivalents have been kept outside the integrated scale to equal their pay with other Civil Services.

*Existing
Pay Scales*

147.13 The existing pay scales applicable to service officers are:

2nd Lt. to Brig. - Rs.2300-100-3900-150-4200-EB-150-5100

Rank Pay (Rs. per month)

Capt	200
Major	600
Lt Col (S)	800
Colonel	1000
Brig	1200

Major General and Equiv. - Rs.5900-200-6700

Lt Gen and Equiv - Rs.7300-100-7600

Army Cdr and Equiv - Rs.8000

Service Chiefs - Rs.9000

PROVISIONAL COMMISSION AND GRANT OF STIPEND

Armed Forces Proposals

147 14 The Armed Forces have suggested provisional commission in the rank of 2nd Lieut/Midshipman/ Pilot Officers during last year of training in the Service Academies/Sea training with grant of pay and allowances and attendant benefits and counting of this period towards service, pension etc on the analogy of Gp A civilians who draw pay from date of joining. It has been suggested that the order of merit on successful completion of training would be considered for inter-se seniority within the same course. Technical graduates who are at present granted ante-dated seniority be granted provisional commission in the rank of Lieut/Sub Lt/flying officer and be authorised pay with two additional increments. Grant of stipend at pre graduate training academies i.e.NDA and Naval Academies and for period preceding provisional commission for direct entry graduate entrants has also been recommended.

Existing Position

147 15 We find that at present in the last six months of training before commissioning a stipend of Rs.1500 per month is granted. In the case of technical graduates, Law graduates, Met. Branch in Air Force, SSCOs in Navy and Air Force, entrants are granted commission from the date of joining and are thus entitled to pay and allowances from that date.

Our Recommen- dations

147 16 We understand that in the Armed Forces an officer is commissioned only on successful completion of training and free accommodation, boarding and other facilities are available to the trainees. Keeping in view the fact that completion of training is a pre-requisite for grant of commission and the fact that grant of provisional commission may interfere with the existing training methods, we find ourselves unable to accede to the proposal for grant of provisional commission. However, we do feel that the existing stipend granted in the last six months of training is inadequate and not likely to attract potential recruits. We therefore recommend a steep rise in the stipend from Rs.1500 to Rs.8000/- per month to be granted to all cadets for the entire duration of training in the Service Academies i.e. the full period of training at Indian Military Academy and OTA for the Army, period of training after NDA/NAVAC and full period of training for Direct Entry or Short Service Entry for the Navy and post

NDA training period and full duration of training for direct entrants to the Air Force. This would also ensure a better relationship vis-a-vis the civilian Group A Officers although the stipend would be a consolidated one. With the enhancement of stipend, it is recommended that cadets in Service Academies may also pay for the messing, accommodation and allied services which are presently free. We are however, unable to agree to the proposal to grant a stipend in the pre-graduate training academies since all expenditure relating to these cadets is borne by the Government.

*Abolition
of Rank of
2nd Lieut.
and Equiv.*

147.17 With regard to regular commission in the rank of Lieutenant and equivalent, commenting on the number of ranks prevailing in the Armed Forces, the Institute of Defence Studies and Analyses in their consultancy report have suggested that the use of the rank of Second Lieutenant and equivalent may be discontinued in view of there being no specific authorization of appointments in this rank. Considering the exceedingly hierarchical structure of the officers cadre and the large number of levels/ranks as compared to civilians we feel that this recommendation is worth considering and would have the advantage of ensuring faster promotions. Therefore, while we are not in favour of grant of provisional commission in the training academies, **we recommend that the rank of Second Lieutenant and equivalent may be abolished and all officers on commissioning may be granted the rank of Lieutenant and equivalent.**

PROVISIONS RELATING TO PROMOTIONS

*Conditions on
Holding of
Acting Rank*

147.18 The Armed Forces have a system of granting acting rank in field and peace establishments. The acting rank is converted to a paid acting rank and entitles the officer to higher rank pay after he holds the rank for 21 consecutive days. The Armed Forces have suggested abolition of the condition of holding acting unpaid rank for 21 consecutive days before converting it to paid acting rank. We have considered the proposal, and, in view of the fact that on fulfilling the condition, paid acting rank is granted with retrospective effect, do not find sufficient justification for suggesting any change.

*Acting Rank
When Proceeding
on Course of
Instruction*

147.19 It has also been suggested that the condition of holding acting rank for 3 months before proceeding on a course of instruction for continuing to hold paid acting rank may be removed. We have considered the issue and **suggest abolition of the condition of holding acting rank for three months or more before proceeding on a course of instruction** subject to the condition of 21 days continuing to be applied. We are however, unable to accede to the Armed Forces proposal that acting rank should be granted on Corps/Service roster basis, irrespective of location and appointment.

*Qualifying
Service for
Substantive
Promotion*

147.20 In order to mitigate the difficulties of slow career progression, deficiency of officers in junior ranks and to reduce stagnation, substantial reductions in the qualifying period for time based/time scale promotions have been suggested by the Services. We have considered the issue and understand that the provisions available with regard to acting promotions ensure much faster promotion specially upto the rank of Major. We have also been informed that the existing qualifying periods for substantive promotion have been laid down for a graded progression in service career and reduction would not reduce actual

deficiency in junior ranks. However we have analyzed the issue in the context of the Armed Forces suggestion to grant provisional commission in the training academy during the last one year of training.

Our Recommendations

147 21 In view of our proposal to abolish the rank of Second Lieutenant and considering all relevant factors, we feel that only a one year reduction in qualifying service can be justified and accordingly recommend reduction of one year in periods specified for substantive promotions. In our opinion, any further reduction may compromise on the experience requirements for each rank. The following revised qualifying periods for substantive promotions are, therefore, suggested:

Corps	Lt.& Equiv.	Capt.& Equiv. (Yrs.)	Major & Equiv. (Yrs.)	Lt.Col(TS) & Equiv. (Yrs.)
i) Officers of 3 services other than AMC,MNS, RVC,Dental,MF. SL Officers, SD list Officers (Navy) & Br. Commission Officers (AF)	On Completion of Trg.	4	10	20
ii) <u>AMC</u>				
a) AFMC	Date of Joining	1	5	14
b) Direct Entry	Date of Joining		4	13
iii) Army Dental Corps	Date of Joining	1	6	14.5
iv) MNS	On Completion of Trg.	5	12	20
v) RVC	Date of Joining	1	7	17
vi) Military Farms	On Completion of Trg.	5	12	23
vii) SL Officers	-do-	5	12	20
viii) RCOs	-do-	3		

ix) SD List Officers(Navy)	-do-	4	10
x) Branch Comm- ission Officers (AF)	2 years	5	12

*Antedate
Seniority to
Women
Technical
Officers*

147.22 At present, technical officers in the Armed Forces are granted two years' antedate seniority for the purpose of promotions due to the higher qualifications required to be possessed by them. The provision of antedate seniority is not extended to women officers commissioned in the technical corps/services. It has been suggested that this discrimination should be removed and antedate seniority of 2 years should also be provided to women technical officers.

*Our Recommen-
dations*

147.23 We have considered the demand and recommend grant of antedate seniority only in cases where recruitment takes place with essential technical qualifications as part of the recruitment regulations against specified vacancies of technical officers.

*Rank of
Commodore*

147.24 The IDSA report on manpower optimisation in the Armed Forces has suggested reduction of one more rank in the hierarchy i.e. either the Lt. Col. or the Colonel. We find that the Navy has made a proposal that the rank of Commodore in the Navy should be made a substantive rank to be filled by selection. At present the rank of the Commodore in the Navy is a non-substantive administrative rank involving no selection process and there are no sanctioned appointments specifically for Commodores. All vacancies are tenable by Captain/Commodore. We have gone into the issue but in view of the considerable merit of the suggestion made by IDSA that number of service ranks should be reduced, we feel that no change in the existing position should be made. In fact, we suggest that the issue of reduction of one more rank other than that of the Second Lieutenant may be examined by the Ministry.

*ACP Scheme
for Service
Officers*

147.25 We have already outlined the constraints of the cadre structure which results in supersession. We have for civilian employees formulated an Assured Career Progression Scheme whereby financial upgradation to the next higher scale would be granted by delinking promotion from availability of vacancies but subject to fitness for promotion. We find that the integrated pay scale has ensured career progression without ensuring selectivity and the existing mechanism of the efficiency bar which was intended to weed out personnel constituting the non-select stream has not been able to achieve the desired objective. **We, therefore, suggest that the ACP scheme also be applied to Service Officers.** The ACP upgradation to the scale of Captain be granted after 4 years' service, the second to the scale of Major after 10 years service and the third to the scale of Lt.Colonel be granted after 16 years of service. The scheme would also correspond to the proposed eligibility period for substantive promotion to these ranks and it is expected that upto the rank of Major, ACP promotion would coincide with functional promotion and its attendant benefits, especially in the context of the rank based structure of the Armed Forces.

PAY STRUCTURE FOR OFFICERS

Armed Forces' Proposals

147.26 The Armed Forces proposals with regard to formulation of pay scales of officers include fair comparison with top Civil Services, year to year parity in pay of service officers and civil service officers, compensation for special conditions, peculiarities and ethos of military life and the need to attract talent of requisite calibre and to retain experienced personnel. It has been urged that the pay structure should be so devised as to provide motivation for those passed over due to cadre constraints as well as to compensate merit, responsibility and accountability in higher ranks. The erosion in the value of the rupee and the erosion of higher salaries due to incomplete neutralisation of dearness allowance leading to narrowing of gap between the lowest and highest rank of officers and erosion due to income tax liability have also been highlighted. The Armed Forces have also compared the full career aggregate pay of Armed Forces officers with the civil services and differences in life-time earnings of corresponding levels has been brought out. Two separate integrated pay scales, one from 2nd Lieutenant to Colonel and the other from Brigadier to Lieutenant General have been proposed. In addition, a military service and rank pay has been demanded.

147.27 While the general issue of erosion of salaries at higher levels has been considered in our general chapter on the subject, we have considered the other proposals made with regard to pay scales in the succeeding paragraphs

Comparison with Civilians

147.28 In order to properly appreciate the demands relating to the pay structure, we thought it worthwhile to go into the principles adopted by earlier Pay Commissions with regard to formulation of pay scales of service officers. At the time of the Post-War Pay Committee, Service pays generally equalled civilian class-I pays and a specific equation was established with the officers of the Indian Police Service. The Raghuramaiah Committee which was appointed after the Second Pay Commission continued the accepted parallel between Defence Service officers and class I service of the Central Government, particularly the IPS. While stating that the IPS was perhaps the closest civilian analogue to officers of the infantry, the Third CPC, considering the demand of the Armed Forces to be equated to the IAS, noted the multifunctional character of the officer cadre and diversity of functions of various occupational groups and felt that to equate them with a single service would be a defective approach. In their opinion, a comparison with the conglomerate of Class-I Civil Services was more reasonable. The Fourth CPC, accepting that the organisational structure and requirements of services are different, provided compensation in the nature of the pay scales itself

Our Views

147.29 We have considered the issue and feel that the terms and conditions, rank structure and organisational structure of Armed Forces are different and no direct equation with civilians is possible. In addition, the service requirement of maintaining a high standard of physical fitness do not really find a parallel in the civil services. However, from the point of view of granting equitable compensation and in order to attract personnel, broad comparability with civilian scales has to be established although we would not like to venture into direct comparisons with any particular service

Compensation

147.30 As regards the issue of compensation for peculiar features of service

*for Peculiar
Features*

career, we have already elsewhere indicated the special concessions and benefits available as compensation for additional hardships but in our opinion compensation for the organisational structure and the lack of availability of posts at higher levels should be built into the pay structure itself. As far as the aspect of turbulence in service life is concerned, the Third CPC had converted the then existing special disturbance allowance, translating it into an edge in the starting pay scale vis-a-vis the civilian Group A officers which was continued by the Fourth CPC. We have, while formulating the pay scales, recommended a similar edge in the starting pay of the service officer and suggested that the newly commissioned Lieutenant may start at Rs.8250 against a start of Rs.8000 recommended for the civilian Gp. A Officer.

*Parity with
Civil Services*

147.31 The Armed Forces have demanded year to year parity with officers of the civil services keeping in view the rigidity of the cadre structure which prevents proliferation of posts at higher ranks. We find that the promotion prospects, time taken and eligibility criteria for promotion of civil service personnel and Armed Forces are not comparable. The Fourth CPC taking cognisance of the peculiar pyramidal structure had, through the mechanism of integrated pay scales, ensured a certain minimum level of progression delinked from the cadre structure. Consequently, higher replacement scales as compared to replacement scales for corresponding civilian scales were granted by them. We have also considered this aspect while formulating the pay scales and have endeavoured to ensure that professionally competent service officers do not suffer due to the organizational constraints. Secondly, keeping in view the ACP scheme proposed for civilian employees and the minimum progression we have proposed for them we have improved the prospects of service officers by granting parity with civilian Gp. A Officers in the 5th year and from 17th year onwards in the ACP scales. Keeping in view the prescribed ages of retirement of service officers and the fact that a large number of personnel would be discharged after reaching the maximum of the last ACP scale, we have recommended a higher maximum as compared to similarly placed civilians. In our opinion, further compensation for organizational constraints would not be desirable keeping in view the stringent promotion criteria and high degree of selectivity for attaining higher ranks which would justify a higher remuneration for select ranks on functional grounds. With the ACP scheme, we have continued the established principle of equal remuneration for specified length of service relating to the rank.

*Integrated
Scales
Demanded*

147.32 As replacement for the existing integrated pay scale from 2nd Lieutenant to Brigadier and the pay scales at higher ranks, the Armed Forces have suggested two separate integrated pay scales, the first from Second Lieutenant to Colonel and the second from Brigadier to Lieutenant General. This has been proposed with the purpose of restricting the salary progression of lower ranks to reasonable levels as well as to delink the pay progression of higher ranks from availability of vacancies at higher levels.

Our Views

147.33 We have gone into the issue of formulation of officers pay scales in detail and keeping in view the career progression pattern obtaining for Gp. A officers across various organizations of the Government of India and a similar need to provide progression in many other organizations, have come to the conclusion that having a separate dispensation for Armed Forces personnel in terms of nature of pay scales has repercussions on civilian employees and a better method would be to provide explicit compensation in regular pay scales. Secondly, another defect

in the system of integrated pay scale is that it allows progression in pay without adequate selectivity, especially in the case of the Major who is allowed to reach a pay of Rs.5700/- per month only on the basis of years of service and passing prescribed examinations. While we fully agree that competent Majors who could not get promotion to the rank of Lt. Colonel due to lack of vacancies should be allowed pay progression, the existing system does not weed out unfit personnel effectively. In view of these considerations, we recommend that the integrated pay scales be replaced by regular pay scales but the progression in pay may be provided through the mechanism of the ACP scheme. With the introduction of ACP scheme screening may be done before grant of the next ACP scale. With regard to the pay of the Major we feel that it should be so designed as to discourage continuance in service of the officers beyond 20 years of service if he has not been found fit to be granted the ACP scale of the Lieutenant Colonel. We have accordingly adjusted the span of the pay scale of the Major. As regards grant of integrated pay scales at higher levels, we find that similar problems of inadequate vacancies exists in many organizations. Our effort should be to provide a reasonable pay package while not necessarily equalling the progression which is accompanied with distinctly higher responsibilities. We have, however, improved the span of scales at higher levels which will provide relief from stagnation.

*Principles for
Fixing Pay
on Promotion*

147.34 Based on the above broad framework, the basic principles followed by us for formulation of Armed Forces pay scales have been that compensations presently provided in pay progression and the concept of equal remuneration for each rank based on number of years of service put in should continue to remain applicable. Secondly, we also felt that the benefits afforded due to common pay scales for all categories of officers should be continued in the scheme of regular pay scales also, unlike the provisions prevailing prior to Fourth CPC where flying branch and specialist branches like AMC and ADC etc. were on separate set of pay scales. The third aspect considered by us was regarding the remuneration for acting ranks. Regarding this principle, in the light of available provisions for grant of acting rank, we considered the various options available to us of either extending the scales backwards or providing compensation for acting rank through some other means. After deliberating over it at length, we felt that the problem could be taken care of through the mechanism of the rank pay. We have therefore retained the existing concept of rank pay as a means to provide the additional increase on promotions. In case of grant of acting promotion, since we have not extended the scales backwards, we suggest that the officer may continue to draw pay in the lower scale but may be allowed the rank pay of the rank in which he is officiating till he has completed the prescribed number of years for grant of substantive promotion. In case of substantive promotions and where acting rank has been granted after completing qualifying service for grant of substantive promotion, pay may be fixed at the same stage in the higher scale or at the next higher stage if no identical stage exists, and the rank pay of the higher rank may be paid in addition. We feel that this method is also in keeping with the existing arrangement whereby the minimum pay of the higher rank is not granted unless prescribed number of years have been completed, but higher Rank Pay is allowed. However, for promotion to the rank of Major General and above, the existing provisions on pay fixation may continue to be applicable.

*Recommended
Pay Scales*

147.35 Keeping the above considerations in view and in the light of the abolition of the rank of 2nd Lieutenant proposed by us, we recommend the following pay scales for service officers upto the rank of Brigadier:

	(Rs.)
Lieutenant	8250-300-10050
Captain	9600-300-11400
Major	11600-325-14850
Lt. Colonel	13500-400-17100
Colonel	15100-450-17350
Brigadier	15350-450-17600

In addition, the following rank pay may be granted:

Rank Pay

	(Rs.)
Captain	400
Major	1200
Lt. Col.	1600
Col.	2000
Brig.	2400

Starting Pay for AMC Officers

147.36 For officers of the AMC we recommend the following revised starting pay keeping in view the existing position:

<u>For Those Commissioned as</u>	<u>AMC</u>	<u>ADC</u> (in Rs.)	<u>RVC</u>
Lieutenants	9150	9150	9150
Captains	9450	-	-

Other Pay Scales

147.37 As regards the pay scales at higher levels, in view of the existing relativities we suggest that the Major Generals may be granted the pay scale of 18400-500-22400 and Lieutenant Generals and equivalent be granted the pay scale of Rs.22400-525-24500. For Vice Chiefs and Army Commander and equivalent we recommend a pay of Rs.26000 (fixed) per month.

Pay of Service Chiefs

147.38 As regards the pay of Service Chiefs, we recommend a revised pay of Rs.30000 (fixed) corresponding to their existing scale of Rs.9,000 (fixed).

PAY STRUCTURE OF MNS OFFICERS

Background

147.39 The Fourth Pay Commission had not accepted the Armed Forces proposal of granting same pay scales to MNS as for other Service Officers and had proposed rank-based pay to MNS Officers for various ranks. However, in consonance with the integrated pay scale for officers upto the rank of Brig., an integrated pay scale was accepted by Government upto the rank of Col. in the MNS Cadre starting from Rs.2200/- to Rs.4500/- The Brigadier's pay scale was suggested at Rs.4600-100-5000 and that of the Maj. Gen. at Rs.5100-150-5700 against General list cadre Maj. Gen.'s scale of Rs.5900-150-6700.

Services

147.40 The Armed Forces have made the following proposals with regard to

pay of MNS Officers:

- a) There should be two integrated pay scales one upto rank of Col. and other from Brig. to Maj. Gen.
- b) The start of scale of Lt. to Col. should be one increment below the start of general list cadre.
- c) B.Sc.(Nursing) entrants to MNS cadre should continue to have one year ante-date seniority over Diploma entrants.
- d) To compensate for merit and responsibility of higher ranks, rank pay should be introduced.

Our recommendations

147.41 We have considered the demands keeping in view the approach followed by earlier commissions and the compensation available to civilian nurses. **We are of the opinion that it would not be fair to evolve their pay structure totally in line with civil nurses keeping in view the all India liability and military service element.** In the case of MNS officers, we therefore suggest that the parities evolved by Fourth CPC may be maintained and MNS officers may continue to be paid at a starting pay scale equal to the Gp A civilian starting scale.

Recommended Pay Scales

147.42 Keeping in view the existing pay scales, the minimum pay prescribed for each rank and the proposals made for General List Service Officers, the following revised scales are recommended for MNS Officers:

(Rs.)

Lieutenant	8000-300-9500
Captain	9400-300-12100
Major	11200-300-14800
Lt. Colonel	12800-300-15200
Colonel	13400-300-15500
Brigadier	14700-300-16200
Maj. General	16400-450-20000

ACP Scheme

147.43 As regards the ACP scheme for MNS Officers, we suggest that the first ACP upgradation to the scale of Captain may be granted after 5 years service, the second ACP upgradation to the scale of Major after 12 years' service and the third to the scale of Lt. Col. after 18 years' service. Pay on promotion may be fixed in the same manner as suggested for service officers.

Fixation of Pay in Proposed Scales

Background

148.1 We have made recommendations with regard to fixation of pay in the proposed scales in respect of civilian employees in the relevant chapter. The method of pay fixation on revision of pay adopted by earlier Pay Commissions for civilians and service personnel was more or less identical. The Fourth CPC while following a similar dispensation for civilian and Service Personnel had given specific illustrations of the manner in which pay for service personnel should be fixed especially in the context of the introduction of integrated pay scales for Service Officers.

Our Recommendations

148.2 We have deliberated over the manner in which service pays should be fixed and in order to ensure equality of treatment **suggest that the method of fixation of pay on revision recommended for civilian employees may also be adopted for service personnel.** For Service Officers upto the rank of Brigadier who are to be brought on to regular scales of pay from the existing integrated scale, we suggest that for fixation of pay the existing rank pay may be taken into account but pay in revised scales be fixed after deducting the revised amount of rank pay. While the method of fixation and illustrations given for civilians would apply mutatis mutandis to PBOR and Service Officers of the rank of Major General and above, the following illustrations indicate the manner in which pay should be fixed for armed forces officers upto the rank of Brigadier:

Illustration No. 1

1. Rank	Major
2. Pay + Rank Pay(Rs. 3400+600)	Rs. 4,000
3. Stage in the scale	1st stage
4. D.A. at index avg. 1510 + Interim Relief	Rs. 5,680
5. Existing Emoluments	Rs. 9,680
6. Add 20% of (Pay +Rank Pay)	Rs. 800
7. Total	Rs. 10,480

8. Pay after deducting revised Rank Pay of Rs. 1200 Rs. 9,280
- 9 Pay in the revised scale Rs. 11,600 + 1,200 Rank Pay

Illustration No. 2

- | | |
|---|-----------------------------|
| 1. Rank | Lt. Colonel |
| 2. Pay + Rank Pay(Rs.4500+800) | Rs. 5,300 |
| 3. Stage in the Pay of Lt. Colonel | 7th Stage |
| 4. Dearness Allowance at index avg. 1510+Interim Relief | Rs. 6,513 |
| 5. Existing Emoluments | Rs.11,813 |
| 6. Add 20% of (Pay +Rank Pay) | Rs. 1,060 |
| 7. Total | Rs.12,873 |
| 8. Amount after deducting revised Rank Pay of Rs. 1600 | Rs.11,273 |
| 9. Pay in the revised scale after adding one increment | Rs.13,900+Rs.1,600 Rank Pay |

Illustration No. 3

- | | |
|--|-----------------------------|
| 1. Rank | Colonel |
| 2. Pay + Rank Pay (Rs.5100+1000) | Rs. 6,100 |
| 3. Stage in existing scale | 5th stage |
| 4. DA at index avg. 1510 + Interim relief | Rs. 7,370 |
| 5. Existing emoluments | Rs.13,470 |
| 6. Add 20% of (Pay+Rank pay) | Rs. 1,220 |
| 7. Total | Rs.14,690 |
| 8. Amount after deducting Rank Pay of Rs. 2000 | Rs.12,690 |
| 9. Pay in the revised scale after adding one increment | Rs.15,550+Rs.2,000 Rank Pay |

Section III

Allowances

Applicability of Compensatory Allowances to the Armed Forces

149.1 Certain allowances like Dearness Allowance, City Compensatory Allowance, Deputation Allowance etc. are common to both Armed Forces and civilian employees. While some of these allowances are granted under identical conditions to both, there are some differences in applicability conditions in case of some allowances. We have discussed the Armed Forces proposals with regard to these allowances mainly with regard to specific suggestions in applicability conditions made by Armed Forces in this chapter.

DA & CCA

149.2 Prior to the Third CPC, Dearness Allowance and City Compensatory Allowance at 80% of the civilian rates were applicable to the PBOR in the Armed Forces, though the officers were entitled to rates applicable to civilians. With the implementation of the Third CPC recommendations, the rates of DA and CCA for the PBOR in the Armed Forces were brought at par with the civilian rates. At present, there is no distinction between the rates of Dearness Allowance and City Compensatory Allowance for Civilians and Armed Forces Personnel.

149.3 We have considered the specific suggestions of the Armed Forces on D.A. and CCA while formulating our recommendations on them. **Our general recommendations on dearness allowance and city compensatory allowance will equally apply to the Armed Forces personnel.**

Special Compensatory Allowance

149.4 The Armed Forces have suggested that Island Special Allowance, which is admissible to civilians but not to the Armed Forces, should also be made applicable to them and Special Compensatory Allowance (Remote Locality), which is available to civilians as well as the Naval and Air Force personnel should also apply to the Army personnel not in receipt of field service concessions.

149.5 We have examined the Armed Forces suggestion regarding applicability of Island special allowance to them in the context of the relative levels of deprivation and compensation for civilians and Armed Forces personnel and find ourselves unable to accede to the demand

149.6 Special Compensatory Allowance (Remote Locality), which was earlier available to the Army personnel, was discontinued after introduction of field service concessions with effect from January, 1993. The Government orders, while enlisting the areas entitled for field service concessions, had specified that the list of areas should be modified from time to time. In view of these provisions, **we do not recommend any change in this regard.**

*Bhutan
Compensatory
Allowance*

149.7 Bhutan Compensatory Allowance (BCA) is admissible to the Armed Forces personnel posted to IMTRAT (Bhutan) at a depression of 22.5% for service officers and 10% for JCOs/ORs in the standard rate of BCA promulgated by the Ministry of External Affairs. This depression is on account of certain service concessions provided to the Armed Forces personnel while in Bhutan.

149.8 The Armed Forces have suggested that the existing depression in BCA for them be removed and if required, they can be charged for the free facilities available to them.

149.9 We have considered the Armed Forces suggestion and **we do not feel any need for change in the existing arrangement.**

*Deputation
(Duty)
Allowance*

149.10 The Armed Forces personnel on deputation to other Central Government Departments are entitled to Deputation (Duty) Allowance at half the rates admissible to civilians, with other conditions of grant being same as for civilians. The reduced rate of deputation (duty) allowance for the Armed Forces are on account of the service concessions which service officers continue to enjoy while on deputation.

149.11 The Armed Forces have suggested that they should be granted deputation (duty) allowance at the same rates as for civilians and the allowance be extended to the service officers posted to the DRDO and Rashtriya Rifles. They have also suggested that the Service officers be considered for deputation on the basis of equivalent pay rather than by rank (as deputation allowance is related to the pay of the post) or else the regulatory provision of basic pay plus deputation allowance not exceeding maximum of the scale of the deputation post be done away with for them.

149.12 The Fourth CPC had considered the issue of deputation (duty) allowance for the Armed Forces and did not recommend any change in the rates of the allowance, in view of service concessions which the service officers continue to enjoy while on deputation. **We also do not see any need for change**, as the rationale for lower rates still holds good. We are also unable to agree to the Armed Forces suggestion regarding extension of this allowance to Armed Forces personnel posted to the DRDO and Rashtriya Rifles, as these postings are not out of the regular line for them. However,

our general recommendation to remove the ceiling on the amount of deputation allowance per month as well as the regulatory provision of basic pay plus deputation allowance not exceeding maximum of the scale of the deputation post, will also apply to the Armed Forces.

149.13 Our general recommendations on incentives for small family norms and Non-Practising Allowance for Medical, Dental and Veterinary personnel will equally apply to the Armed Forces personnel.

*Transport
Allowance*

149.14 With regard to transport allowance for Armed Forces personnel, rates recommended by us for executives elsewhere in the Report would apply to all Commissioned Officers. Similarly rates suggested for Supervisory Staff would apply to all JCOs, for Supporting Staff to all NCOs, Other Ranks and for Auxiliary Staff to Non-combatants (enrolled) of the Air Force.

Risk Related and Compensatory Allowances

INTRODUCTION

General

150.1 The Armed Forces are granted certain allowances as special compensation for additional hardships or exposure to risks and hazards. These include flying pay, submarine pay, para commando pay, diving allowance, field area allowance etc., which are intended to cover the additional hardships faced either due to nature of duties or place of posting. In the proposals received from the Armed Forces, the continuance and enhancement of all these allowances has been proposed and suggestions have been made for introduction of certain new allowances. We have considered each of these allowances related to compensation for additional risks keeping in mind the proposals received from the Services.

FLYING PAY

Background

150.2 Flying pay is granted to officers of the Flying Branch and technical officers and airmen performing air crew duties in the Indian Air Force and equivalent personnel in the Army and Navy. Flying Pay was earlier called Flying Bounty, and was introduced in 1948 to serve as an incentive to persons of the right calibre to join the flying branch for undertaking military flying with its attendant risks. Prior to the Third CPC, Flying Bounty was granted on completion of prescribed number of flying hours per year. The Air Headquarters had represented before the Third CPC that this condition interfered with optimum utilisation of limited facilities available in a flying unit. Proper flying practice was also difficult to be provided to officers assigned to non-flying duties. Besides, due to the sophisticated nature of modern combat aircraft, the duration of a sortie was much less as compared to older aircraft and Government had to incur substantial expenditure in order to ensure completion of flying hours. In view of these arguments, the Third CPC recommended waiver of the condition of flying a

minimum number of hours After the Third CPC, Flying Bounty was renamed as flying pay and was admitted monthly

*Existing
Position*

150.3 The existing rates of flying pay, which were last revised in 1987 on the recommendations of the Fourth CPC, are as follows:
(Rs per month)

- | | |
|---------------------------------------|--------|
| 1. Upto Group Captain and equivalent | 1200/- |
| 2. Above Group Captain and equivalent | 900/- |
| 3. Airmen Aircrew | 900/- |

150.4 While the Air Force/Naval Aviation pilot continues to remain eligible for flying pay even on non flying duties, the Army Aviation pilot is not entitled to flying pay when posted out of Aviation Squadron.

*Armed Forces
Proposals*

150.5 According to the Armed Forces' proposal it is only the officers of the Flying Branch who go into actual combat in the event of war. The data submitted by the Armed Forces indicates that the cost of a MIRAGE - 2000 aircraft is over Rs 100 Crores with per hour cost of flying being Rs.9.8 Lakhs and a Jaguar aircraft costs Rs.26.36 Crores with per hour flying cost being Rs.2.6 Lakhs. The training cost of a fully operational fighter pilot has been estimated to be between Rs.23 to Rs.45 Crores. The high cost of modern combat aircraft and the prohibitive costs of training a fully operational fighter pilot necessitate that personnel of higher intelligence quotient are attracted to the Air Force. It has been stated that military flying is far more exacting and bears a far greater risk than civil aviation. Based on the compensation packages available to similar jobs in the country and flying pay in other countries, considerable enhancement of flying pay has been sought by the Armed Forces. Grant of dearness allowance on flying pay has also been suggested. It has also been suggested that Army Aviation Corps Pilots be made entitled to flying pay on similar terms and conditions as the Air Force and Navy.

*Fighter
Flying
Allowance*

150.6 It has further been suggested that in addition to flying pay, medically fit and active fighter pilots may be authorised a fighter flying allowance in view of the exceptionally high degree of risk in fighter flying, the high rate of accidents and the physical, physiological and psychological stress involved in military flying.

Our Views

150.7 We have gone into the issue in detail and agree that there is a definite need to attract better quality individuals in view of the high costs of aircraft and long and expensive duration of training. The Gulf war has also emphasized the critical role of air power in any future combat and the need to achieve commensurate expertise and technology. We have also taken note of the substantial increases in flying related compensation available to similar personnel in the private and public sector. We feel that introduction of a linkage with flying hours may not be desirable and feasible in the case of the Indian Air Force. In the context of enhancement of rates, we are also conscious of the fact that flying is inherent in the nature of duties of the Air Force and that the high cost of flying

training is borne entirely by the Government. The training so imparted also results in highly marketable skills in the private/ public sector after discharge. While we are convinced of the requirement to enhance flying related compensation, in our opinion a special dispensation for fighter flying is called for. We have taken cognisance of the high degree of risk involved in fighter flying and the tremendous pressure on the pilot who has to operate with a high degree of motivation and precision and are convinced that fighter flying deserves a higher compensation.

*Our
Recommendations*

150.8 Keeping all the above aspects in view, we propose to keep a distinction between fighter pilots and other flying personnel. We therefore recommend that the existing Flying Pay may be renamed as "Flying Allowance" and be enhanced in the following manner:

	(Rs. per month)
1. Fighter pilots	3000/-
2. Other pilots and technical officers - upto the rank of Gp. Captain	2400/-
3. Airmen Aircrew	1800/-

150.9 In our opinion, grant of flying allowance should only be restricted upto the rank of Group Captain and equivalent who are actually expected to do active flying in combat. No change in the existing conditions applicable to Army Aviation Corps Pilots is recommended. We are also unable to agree with the proposal to grant dearness allowance on flying allowance.

TEST PILOT ALLOWANCE

Background

150.10 Test Pilot Allowance was first introduced in 1981 at Rs.250/- per month and is admissible to all qualified Test Pilots in addition to Flying Pay, while they are on posted strength or on attachment to any unit for carrying out test flying duties. The present rate of this allowance as enhanced after Fourth CPC's recommendations is Rs.400/- per month. It is admissible only to Test Pilots and not to Flight Test Engineers and Flight Test Instrumentation Engineers who along with Test Pilots form a flight testing crew on transport and other twin/multiseater aircraft. The Armed Forces have demanded a substantial increase in the allowance in view of the high degree of risk and lack of volunteers. Extension of the allowance to flight testing instrumentation engineers has also been suggested. This allowance is presently paid at the rates of 1/3rd of Flying Pay.

Our Recommendations

150.11 Keeping in view the rates we have suggested in respect of Flying Allowance we recommend that the rate of test pilot allowance may be doubled to Rs.800/-per month. We are of the view that the allowance need not be extended to other categories of personnel.

SUBMARINE PAY

Background

150.12 Submarine Pay was introduced in 1967 for officers and sailors qualified for and appointed as crew for service on submarines, keeping in view the additional risks and arduous conditions of work. The existing rates of submarine pay are at par with flying pay, in view of the recommendations made in this regard by the Fourth CPC.

Armed Forces Proposals

150.13 The Armed Forces have suggested continuance of the parity with flying pay and similar enhancement as flying pay. Extension of the allowance to flag ranks and introduction of an allowance for all submariners qualified in submarine escape training tests have also been suggested.

Our Recommendations

150.14 We have examined the issue and find that while the Third CPC had not found adequate justification for establishing an equation between personnel of the submarine cadre and the flying branch, the Fourth CPC had agreed to the suggestion of parity. We have during our visits also observed the extra risk, discomfort and possible detriment to health inherent in service on submarines. We have also been informed of the lack of volunteers for the submarine arm and the resultant shortages in the cadre. We agree that the conditions on board a submarine are such as would justify an equation with the flying pay recommended by us for fighter pilots and accordingly recommend revision as under:

	Existing Rate	Recommended Rate (in Rs.p.m.)
1. Captain (with more than 3 years service in rank)	900	2200
2. Officers upto Captain	1200	3000
3. Sailors	900	1800

150.15 We also suggest that Submarine Pay may be renamed as Submarine Allowance. For the reason that higher ranks are not normally required to sail in submarines, we do not recommend further extension of the allowance. As regards grant of submarine escape training allowance, we find ourselves unable to agree to the proposal.

SUBMARINE ALLOWANCE

Present Position

150.16 Submarine Allowance is granted to personnel other than qualified submariners who embark on a submarine for training, passage and trials. It is granted at a rate of Rs. 15 per day to officers and Rs. 5 per day to PBOR. The Armed Forces have suggested that since personnel temporarily on board for official purposes are equally subject to risk, hazard and discomfort the rates may be revised

to Rs 90/- per day for officers and Rs 30/- per day for PBOR.

*Revised
Rates*

150 17 We have examined the issue and recommend that submarine allowance may be enhanced to Rs.45/-per day for officers and Rs.15/- per day for sailors. Since submarine pay is proposed to be renamed as submarine allowance, the existing submarine allowance may be renamed as "Submarine Duty Allowance"

DIVING ALLOWANCE AND DIP MONEY

Background

150 18 There are at present two categories of divers in the Navy i.e clearance/deep divers and ships' divers. Ships' divers dive upto a depth of 35 metres and are employed on routine underwater tasks. Clearance diving requires much greater intensive training and entails diving upto a depth of 160 metres and assignment on hazardous/arduous underwater tasks and salvage operations. The complement of sailors undertaking clearance diving is divided into classes based on proficiency obtained after undergoing specified courses. All Naval personnel on the authorised cadre are entitled to diving allowance at monthly rates. In addition, dip money is also admissible at prescribed rates depending on depth and on time spent under water. An attendant allowance is paid at 1/5th of Dip Money admissible to divers' attendants, who are also required to be qualified divers.

*Existing
Rates*

150 19 The existing rates of diving allowance and dip money are:

Diving Allowance

Officers

- | | |
|----------------------------------|---------------|
| i) Clearance/Deep Diving Officer | Rs.200/- p.m. |
| ii) Ship Diving Officer | Rs.100/- p.m. |

Sailors

- | | |
|------------------------------|-------------|
| 1. Clearance Diver Class I | Rs.150 p.m. |
| 2. Clearance Diver Class II | Rs.130 p.m. |
| 3. Clearance Diver Class III | Rs.110 p.m. |
| 4. Ship Diver | Rs.100 p.m. |

Dip Money is paid at normal rates to ships' divers and at twice the rates to clearance/deep divers, the existing normal rates being as follows:

Depth (in Fathoms)	Existing Rates Per Minute (in Rs.)
Upto 20	0.30
20-30	0.45
30-40	0.60

40-50	0.90
50-60	1.20
60-75	1.70
75-100	1.90

*Services
Proposals*

150.20 On the ground that divers are engaged in specialised and hazardous operations and in view of enlargement in their scope of activities, the Armed Forces have suggested that the existing rates of diving allowance and dip money may be enhanced four times and extended to Army and Air Force personnel qualified in diving.

Our Recommendations

150.21 We find that the rates of the diving allowance and dip money have been enhanced by earlier Pay Commissions keeping in view the high risk and hazard and the psychological strain imposed. We are inclined to agree that there is a high degree of risk involved in undertaking underwater operations and recommend that the existing rates of the diving allowance and dip money, which were sanctioned in 1986 may be doubled. However, we do not recommend extension to any other category of personnel.

SPECIAL FORCES ALLOWANCE

Present Position

150.22 The erstwhile Para Commando battalions of the Army have been restructured and redesignated as Special Forces for conducting specialised operations. These forces are at present entitled to para commando allowance. The existing rates of Para Commando Allowance are:

- a) Officers - Rs.350 per month
- b) JCOs - Rs.250 per month
- c) ORs - Rs.175 per month

*Services
Proposals*

150.23 The Armed Forces have stated that the Special Forces are specialised troops and carry out covert and limited overt strategic and technical military operations in war and in low intensity conflicts. There is considerable risk to life and limb in these operations as well as in day to day training. Keeping in view the high rate of casualties during operations and the hazardous nature of duties, the Armed Forces have suggested considerable enhancement in the rates of Para Commando or Special Forces Allowance. It has also been suggested that Para Pay as authorised to paratroopers may be made applicable to Special Forces personnel in addition. For those of the personnel who are trained in free fall parachuting and in underwater diving and demolition, introduction of Free Fall Allowance and Diving Allowance/Dip Money have been suggested.

Our Recommendations

150.24 We have considered the various suggestions made by the Armed Forces and recognising the additional risks undertaken by these personnel recommend that the present Para Commando Pay may be redesignated as

Special Forces Allowance' without any change in the scope of its application and the rates be enhanced as follows

1. Officers - Rs.700 per month
2. JCOs - Rs.500 per month
3. Ors - Rs.350 per month

150.25 However, we do not recommend introduction of para pay, free fall allowance or diving allowance/dip money for these personnel.

*Air Force
Commandoes*

150.26 At present, no para commando allowance is paid to Air Force Commandos who are trained in anti-hijacking operations. We recommend that the allowance may be extended to Air Force Commando personnel also.

MARINE COMMANDOS AND CHARIOT PAY

Background

150.27 The Marine Commando cadre was created in 1987 with a complement of 38 officers and 373 sailors. These personnel were selected from clearance and ships divers of the Navy for meeting the threat to national offshore areas. The Chariot cadre personnel are required to operate the submersible crafts (CHARIOTS) during preemptive strikes in enemy harbours.

*Existing
Rates*

150.28 In view of the risky nature of their duties, personnel of the cadre are entitled to Marine Commando and Chariot Pay at the following rates:

(Rs. per month)

- | | |
|---|------|
| 1. Capt.(with more than 3 yrs. service in rank) | 900 |
| 2. Other officers upto Captain | 1200 |
| 3. Sailors | 900 |

*Armed Forces
Proposals*

150.29 The Armed Forces have suggested continuance of the existing parity of the Marine Commandos and Chariot Pay with Submarine Pay in view of the increasing frequency with which they are called upon to perform and have suggested revised rates of Rs.7000 p.m. for officers and Rs.5500 for sailors.

*Our Recommen-
dations*

150.30 We have considered the issue and feel that the differences in duration of deployment, and in the roles warrant a separate treatment for submariner and these personnel. Taking into account the multifaceted training and professionalism of the Marcos Cadre and the risks involved in operating the Chariots, both of which we had occasion to observe, we recommend that the existing rates of Marine Commando and Chariot Pay may be doubled.

PARA PAY AND PARA RESERVE PAY

General

150.31 Parachute Pay is granted to officers and men of the Army holding appointments of operational parachutists authorised in the War/Peace establishment of their units. These paratroopers are required to be dropped behind enemy lines and carry out operations independently or in conjunction with follow up ground forces. On landing, they operate like normal infantrymen. For continuance of grant of para pay in each year, a parachute refresher course including a minimum of two jumps is to be attended. Parachute Pay ceases from the day a person vacates his operational parachutist appointment or from the date on which he is struck off the strength of a parachute unit on permanent posting to his Regimental or Corps Centre.

Para Reserve Pay

150.32 Individuals posted as parachute reservists to nonparachute units are entitled to Para Reserve Pay from the date of posting as reservist at half the rates of Para Pay. For transfer of trained parachutists to para reserve, an individual should have a minimum of three years' service in a para unit as a trained parachutist and should be less than 35 years of age. For grant of Para Reserve Pay also, parachute refresher course is required to be attended.

Existing Rates

150.33 The existing rates of para pay are:

- a) Officers Rs. 150 per month
- b) JCOs/ORs Rs. 100 per month

Armed Forces Proposals

150.34 The Armed Forces have suggested substantial increases in the rates of Para Pay and have suggested its extension to entitled Air Force and Naval personnel.

Our Suggestions

150.35 Considering the various factors, we recommend that the Para Pay and Para Reserve Pay may be renamed as Para Allowance and Para Reserve Allowance and may be paid at the following rates:

	Para Allowance	Para Reserve Allowance (in Rs. per month)
a) Officers	300	150
b) JCOs/ORs	200	100

150.36 We, however, do not find sufficient justification for extending the allowance to Naval and Air Force personnel.

PARA JUMP INSTRUCTOR PAY

*Present
Position*

150.37 Indian Air Force Officers and personnel who are employed as parachute jumping instructors are granted Para Jump Instructor Pay of Rs.300 per month for Officers and Rs 200 per month for Airmen. These instructors are volunteers from Ground Duty Branches and have to undergo stiff medical tests for selection.

Demand

150.38 The Armed Forces have suggested enhancement of Para Jump Instructor Pay to Rs.1200/- per month for officers and Rs.900/- per month for airmen in order to motivate personnel to volunteer for the job. Introduction of Free Fall Jump Instructor Pay has also been suggested.

Our Recommendations

150.39 We have considered these suggestions and recommend that Para Jump Instructor Pay be renamed as Para Jump Instructor Allowance and doubled. We are, however, unable to agree with the suggestion to introduce Free Fall Jump Instructor Pay.

COMBAT HAZARD ALLOWANCE

*Armed Forces
Proposal*

150.40 The Armed Forces have suggested that a Combat Hazard Allowance be introduced for troops in field areas, high altitude areas and Siachen, special forces of the three services and for personnel serving in areas which may in future be declared field areas on the ground that a distinction is required to be maintained between these troops and those otherwise deployed.

Our Recommendations

150.41 In our opinion, combat hazard is inherent in military duties and the various concessions and allowances available to Armed Forces take into account this hazard. We therefore do not recommend introduction of a separate Combat Hazard Allowance.

COUNTER INSURGENCY OPERATIONS ALLOWANCE

*Existing
Position*

150.42 Since 1994, troops deployed on Counter Insurgency operations have been treated on par with troops deployed in field areas and granted Counter Insurgency Operations Allowance (CI Ops. Allowance) at field area allowance rates. Troops operating away from their permanent locations for over 30 days qualify for grant of the allowance. No other monetary allowance is admissible to troops on deployment. The existing rates of counter-insurgency operations allowance are:

	<u>Rate/month</u> (in Rs)
Lt. Col & Above	975
Lt Col.(TS) & Major	895
Captain	820
2nd Lt /Lt.	780
JCOs/Hony Commissioned Officers	650
Havildar	450
Sep/Naik incl Ncs(E)	375

*Armed Forces
Proposals*

150.43 It has been suggested by the Armed Forces that CI Ops. Allowance should continue to be equated to field area allowance but should be admissible in addition to field area allowance/modified field area allowance/high altitude allowance. Extension of the allowance to troops permanently located in CI Ops area and engaged in CI Operations and to Static Establishments/Headquarters in the area of operations has also been proposed. It has also been urged that Navy and Air Force when engaged in Counter Insurgency Operations may also be made entitled to grant of the allowance.

*Our Recommen-
dations*

150.44 After careful consideration of all the suggestions made, we recommend that the existing parity with field area allowance may continue and rates suggested by us for field area allowance in the subsequent paragraphs may be made applicable to these personnel also. We, however, do not suggest any expansion in the scope of application of the allowance.

FIELD SERVICE CONCESSIONS

Background

150.45 Prior to Fourth Pay Commission, field service concessions were granted in the form of free rations, free single accommodation including allied services and some minor concessions like free postage. A married officer was entitled to Rs.140/- in addition as separation allowance on account of separation from his family. However, high altitude allowance, uncongenial climate allowance were also granted where applicable. For personnel below officer rank, for service in field areas, besides concessions like free postage and free replacement of uniform, special compensatory allowance was admissible as compensation for hard life and lack of amenities in field areas.

*Present
Position*

150.46 The Fourth CPC had recommended that classification of areas for grant of field service concessions be reviewed by Govt. and the concessions decided keeping in view special compensatory allowances recommended for civilians. Based on that recommendation, field service concessions for the Armed Forces have been rationalised. Field areas have been classified as field areas and modified field areas and separate compensation based on operational readiness and availability of facilities introduced in 1993.

150.47 In addition, high altitude areas have been categorised as:

- i) areas between 9000 ft. and 15000 ft. including uncongenial climate areas below 9000 feet, and
- ii) areas above 15000 feet in height for the purpose of grant of high altitude allowance.

For Siachen area which is permanently snow-bound Siachen allowance has been introduced. We have considered the proposals made by the Armed Forces regarding field service concessions in the succeeding paragraphs.

FIELD AREA ALLOWANCE

Definition 150.48 Field area is an area where troops are deployed near the borders for operational requirements and where imminence of hostilities and associated risk to life exists. Troops in such areas are located for reasons of operational considerations alone and are not living in cantonments.

Applicability 150.49 Field Area Allowance has been made admissible to personnel serving in detachments, units and formations in these areas. No field area allowance is granted to static formations, NCC directorates, TA Units, Record Offices etc.

Demand 150.50 The Armed Forces have suggested substantial enhancements in the rates field area allowance in view of the difficult conditions of service in these areas. Combat Hazard Allowance has been proposed to be paid in addition.

Our Recommendations 150.51 We have considered the suggestions and find that the rates of field area allowance have been fixed recently in April 1993. In view of this, we recommend that rates of field area allowance be increased in the following manner:

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing</u> (in Rs. per month)	<u>Proposed Rates</u>
Lt.Col. & above	975	1300
Major	895	1200
Captain	820	1100
Subaltern	780	1050

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing</u> (in Rs. per month)	<u>Proposed Rates</u>
JCO	650	900
Havildar	450	600
Sep/NK	375	500

MODIFIED FIELD AREA ALLOWANCE

Definition

150.52 Modified field area is an area where troops are deployed in support of combat troops in an operational support role. Degree of operational readiness is slightly lower than that in field area but sustained surveillance continues

Our Recommendations

150.53 The Armed Forces have suggested upward revision of the rates of modified field area allowance keeping in mind the fair degree of deprivation and hardship in these areas. However, keeping in view the fact that rates of the allowance have also been fixed in 1993, we recommend enhancement of the rates in the following manner:

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Rates</u>	<u>Proposed Rates</u>
	(in Rs. p.m)	
a) Lt.Col. & above	375	500
b) Major	350	465
c) Capt.	325	430
d) Subaltern	300	400
e) JCOs	225	300
f) Havildar	175	230
g) Sep/NK	150	200

HIGH ALTITUDE ALLOWANCE

Present Position

150.54 High Altitude Allowance is admissible in addition to field area allowance. The existing rates of high altitude allowance are:

	Category I (Ht. from 9000 ft. to 15000 ft including uncongenial climate areas below 9000 ft.)	Category II (Above 15,000 feet)
	(Rs. per month)	
a) Lt.Col.& above	400	600
b) Major	350	525
c) Capt.	250	375
d) Subaltern	200	300
e) JCOs	180	270
f) Havildar	140	210
g) Sep/NK	100	150

Services' Proposal

150.55 The Armed Forces have proposed recategorisation of height brackets suggesting that higher rate of allowance be made admissible for heights

above 12000 ft., instead of the existing 15000 feet, in order to compensate maximum number of troops and in view of harsh living conditions and pronounced effect of high altitude beyond this height. Payment of Combat Hazard element in addition has also been suggested.

Our Recommendations

150.56 Since the rationalisation of field service concessions has taken place only in 1993, we feel it would not be appropriate to disturb the existing classification of high altitude areas. As regards the rates of the allowance, consistent with increases suggested for field area and modified field area allowance, we recommend the following revised rates for High Altitude Area Allowance:

	<u>Category I</u>	<u>Category II</u>
	(in Rs. per month)	
a) Lt.Col.& above	530	800
b) Major	465	700
c) Capt.	330	500
d) Subaltern	265	400
e) JCOs	240	360
f) Havildar	185	280
g) Sep/NK	135	200

SIACHEN ALLOWANCE

Background

150.57 Siachen Allowance is paid to troops serving in the Siachen region. The allowance is payable in addition to field area allowance. Units are deployed in the area for a 6 month tenure. Due to the temperative and difficult conditions in the area, personnel are subjected to a very high level of physical and mental fatigue with a pronounced degradation in mental faculties and reactions. High degree of casualties have also been reported from troops in this area due to harsh climatic conditions.

Proposal

150.58 In their proposal, the Armed Forces have suggested that rates of Siachen Allowance may be enhanced from the existing Rs.1200 per month for Officers to Rs.7000 per month and for PBOR from Rs.800 per month to Rs.4500 per month. In addition, payment of Combat Hazard Allowance has also been proposed.

Our recommendations

150.59 While the rates of Siachen Allowance have also been fixed in 1993, we feel that the extremely harsh conditions in the area deserve special consideration and a substantial revision in rates is called for. Keeping in view the high incidence of casualties, the harsh environmental conditions and inadequate facilities in the area, we recommend that the rates of Siachen Allowance may be enhanced as follows:

Officers	Rs.3000 per month
JCO/ORs	Rs.2000 per month

REVIEW OF AREAS

Our Views 150.60 The Armed Forces have also suggested a review of the areas qualifying for grant of field service concessions and inclusion of certain areas. We find that provision already exists whereby classification of areas is to be reviewed every three years. We, therefore, feel that the task is best left to the Ministry of Defence in keeping with the present Government Orders.

SEA SERVICE CONCESSIONS

Present Position 150.61 The existing sea service concessions available as compensation for hardships at sea include:

- i) Hardlying money,
- ii) Separation allowance for officers, and
- iii) Sea duty allowance for sailors.

Hardlying Money 150.62 Hardlying money is in the nature of compensation for extra discomforts of service inherent on smaller ships for periods during which Naval personnel actually live and sleep on board specified classes of ships. It is, therefore, not paid for duty in larger ships. In the smaller ships like mine sweepers, ocean-going tugs, patrol crafts and submarines, hardlying money is paid at full rates and in the relatively more comfortable vessels like the destroyers, petya class ships and certain tankers it is paid at half rates.

Present Rates 150.63 The existing 'full' rates of hardlying money are as follows:

Officers	Rs.100 per month
Sailors	Rs.70 per month

Our Recommendations 150.64 The Armed Forces have proposed substantial enhancements in the rates of hardlying money based on tonnage of ships while suggesting retention of the existing applicability conditions. We have studied the existing provisions with regard to hardlying money and recommend that the existing rates of hardlying money may be doubled but the existing classification of ships and applicability conditions may be retained.

SEPARATION ALLOWANCE AND SEA DUTY ALLOWANCE

Services Proposals

150.65 As regards the existing separation allowance for officers and sea duty allowance for sailors, the Armed Forces have contended that since the separation allowance and special compensatory allowance earlier available to the Army and Air Force personnel whilst serving in field areas, have been replaced by a new set of allowances, the same may be done for the Navy. They have therefore suggested that a sea going allowance may be introduced in lieu of separation allowance and special compensatory allowance be admissible when the ship leaves her base port for more than 12 hours for ships of 5000 tons and above and four hours for ships of less than 5000 tons. The revision has been sought keeping in mind the linkage with allowances available earlier in field areas.

Background

150.66 We find that the Fourth CPC had considered the suggestion of Naval Headquarters for grant of separate compensation to officers and sailors posted on ships but had not found adequate justification for the payment of a separate sea service concession. The Armed Forces have stated that when field service concessions were taken up for rationalisation by the Ministry of Defence in 1992, the concessions available to the Navy were not considered. As a consequence, separation allowance and sea duty allowance for the navy remained unaltered.

Existing Position

150.67 The existing rate of separation allowance for officers is Rs. 140 per month calculated on a daily basis on the condition that the ship should have been outside home port for 12 hours or more. The existing rates of sea duty allowance which is also calculated in a similar manner are:

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Rate</u> (Rs. p.m)
Hony. Commissioned/MCPO/CPO	53/-
PO	38/-
Ldg	33/-
SEA I/II	30/-

Our recommendations

150.68 We have carefully examined the demands made with regard to sea service concessions and feel that compensation for sea service should only be restricted to number of days actually spent at sea. As regards the nature and amount of compensation, we feel that in view of rationalisation of field service concessions for Army and Air Force, there is some justification for rationalising sea going allowances. However, in our opinion, stay at sea for Naval personnel is for a less prolonged duration on each occasion as compared to stay in field areas for the Army. Besides, going to sea is inherent in the nature of duties of the Navy. Keeping in view all these factors, we recommend that the present separation allowance may also be redesignated as 'Sea Duty Allowance'. The revised rates should be as under:

Rank	(Rs. p.m)
1. Commanders and above	335
2. Lieut Commander	300
3. Lieutenant	280
4. Sub Lt./Acting Sub Lt.	265
5. MCPO I, II and CPO	200
6. Petty Officer	150
7. Leading Seaman and Below	130

EXPATRIATION ALLOWANCE

<i>Present Position</i>	150.69	Personnel in the Navy are entitled to an expatriation allowance when operating in specified international waters. The allowance is not admissible in conjunction with daily allowance. While the rates of this allowance for Air Force and Navy personnel have been linked to the foreign allowance of the country of deployment, in the Navy it has not been possible to relate the rates to any specific country while operating in international waters.
<i>Services Proposals</i>	150.70	The existing rates of expatriation allowance vary from Rs.10 per month for Seaman I and II to Rs.250 per month for Rear Admirals. The Armed Forces have proposed considerable enhancement in the rates of the allowance and expansion in the scope of application of the allowance.
<i>Our Recommendations</i>	150.71	We have examined the conditions of grant of the allowance in the context of other compensations available while at sea. We feel that while sailing in international waters no extra financial burden is imposed on the Naval personnel. We have already recommended enhancement in the rates of sea duty allowance and hardy money and since these compensations would be available in all maritime areas, we do not see any justification for continuance of expatriation allowance. We therefore recommend that expatriation allowance may be discontinued.

EXPLOSIVE CLEARANCE ALLOWANCE

<i>Our Recommendations</i>	150.72	An explosive clearance allowance has been demanded by the Armed Forces for personnel involved in clearance of bombs, explosive devices and mines during counter insurgency operations and low intensity conflicts. We have not recommended any such allowance for personnel in other organizations engaged in similar duties. Moreover, substantial ex-gratia payments have been recommended by us for casualties in such operations. We are, therefore, unable to agree with the proposal for a separate Explosive Clearance Allowance.
----------------------------	--------	--

Functional Related Allowances

INTRODUCTION

General

151.1 At present, three functional related allowances -entertainment allowance, special allowance to catering assistants employed as air stewards and air despatch pay - are admissible to Armed Forces Personnel. The Armed Forces have proposed enhancement of the existing allowances and introduction of three new functional related allowances.

ENTERTAINMENT ALLOWANCE

Present Position

151.2 Entertainment allowance is admissible to Service Officers holding specified appointments in order to enable them to meet expenses on mandatory official entertainment. The existing rates of the allowance range from Rs. 6600 p.a. for Service Chiefs to Rs. 100 p.m. for sector Commanders/Naval Officers in-charge of a ship/Air Officer Commanding, station. It has been suggested that this allowance be renamed as "Official Hospitality Grant" and certain other appointments such as commanding officers of units/establishments and heads of training institutions be included within its purview. Further the rates of this allowance be enhanced by 4 to 12 times.

Our recommendations

151.3 We feel that the existing list of specified appointments entitled to this allowance is adequate. **We recommend that the grant of this allowance be rationalised and its rates revised in the following manner :-**

Appointment	Proposed Rate p.m.
Service Chiefs and Vice Chiefs/Army Commanders and equivalent	Rs.1000
Other appointments in the rank of Lt. Genl. and equivalent presently in receipt of entertainment allowance	Rs.800

Appointments in the rank of Major Genl. and equivalent presently granted entertainment allowance	Rs.600
Appointments in the rank of Brigadier and equivalent presently entitled to entertainment allowance	Rs.500
CO of a ship of Capt. rank and equivalent presently in receipt of entertainment allowance	Rs.400
Naval Officer incharge/CO upto Cdr. rank presently in receipt of entertainment allowance	Rs.200

We also endorse the suggestion of the Armed Forces that the existing entertainment allowance be renamed as "Official Hospitality Grant"

SPECIAL ALLOWANCE TO CATERING ASSISTANTS

*Armed Forces
Proposal*

151.4 A special allowance of Rs. 200/- p.m. is paid to airmen of the catering assistant trade employed as air stewards in Air Headquarters Communication squadron, which is responsible for transportation of high ranking Indian and foreign dignitaries within and outside India. It has been suggested in the Armed Forces memorandum that this allowance be enhanced to Rs. 500 p.m and extended to catering assistants performing duties of air stewards in the communication flights of the IAF commands and to Stewards of Navy and Army when performing similar duties.

*Our
recommendations*

151.5 The rate of this special allowance was fixed in 1991. We recommend that the rate be enhanced to Rs. 300 p.m. We, however, do not agree to the suggestion to extend this allowance to other categories of personnel

AIR DESPATCH PAY

*Our
recommendations*

151.6 Air Despatch pay at the rate of Rs. 60 p.m is admissible to JCOs and other ranks who are employed on airdropping of supplies in forward areas. Air Despatch pay is linked to a minimum of 24 sorties per year. In view of the hazardous nature of duties involved in Air Despatch, we recommend that Air Despatch Pay may be enhanced to Rs. 120 p.m.

NEW ALLOWANCES

Our Views

151.7 We have considered in detail the proposal of the Armed Forces for introduction of new allowances, viz., instructional allowance, headquarters allowance and scout allowance, but find ourselves unable to accede to this demand.

Qualification Related Allowances

INTRODUCTION

152.1 The **Armed** Forces are granted certain qualification related allowances based on their acquiring certain qualifications or on performing specialised duties after obtaining some qualifications. It has been suggested in the Armed Forces memorandum that the rates of the existing qualification related allowances be enhanced and the scope of some of them broadened. Introduction of certain new qualification related allowances has also been proposed.

QUALIFICATION PAY AND QUALIFICATION GRANT

General

152.2 Qualification pay on a monthly basis is granted for certain flying qualifications which are required to be updated periodically. It is also granted to Military Nursing Service officers for undergoing prescribed courses. Qualification grant - a lump-sum one-time grant - is sanctioned to officers for undergoing courses which have a one-time qualification.

Background

152.3 The system of monthly qualification pay for Armed Forces Officers was introduced in 1948 as an incentive for acquiring certain qualifications. Subsequently, in 1962, the system of qualification grant was introduced for specified courses. The Third CPC, besides finding many anomalies in the system of grant of qualification pay, observed that most of the qualifications and courses for which monthly qualification pay was granted on a continuous basis involved only one-time effort. Accordingly, it recommended that except for certain flying qualifications and courses for MNS officers which would continue to be covered by qualification pay, all other qualifications and courses should be covered by a one-time qualification grant. The Fourth CPC continued with the same classification

QUALIFICATION GRANT

**Our
recommendations**

152.4 The one-time Qualification grant is admissible to Service Officers at four different rates linked to four categories of specified courses. The Fourth CPC had recommended an enhancement of 25% in the rates of qualification grant. Keeping this factor in mind, we recommend that the rates of qualification grant be revised as follows :-

Courses	Existing	Proposed
Category I Courses	Rs. 7,500/-	Rs. 10,000/-
Category II Courses	Rs. 5,625/-	Rs. 7,500/-
Category III Courses	Rs. 3,000/-	Rs. 4,500/-
Category IV Courses	Rs. 2,000/-	Rs. 3,000/-

152.5 We understand that the Armed Forces have submitted a proposal to the Ministry of Defence for revision of courses eligible for qualification grant. We suggest that the Ministry of Defence may finalise the revised list of courses at the earliest. While doing so, it may be ensured that there is scope for utilising the qualifications obtained by officers, and courses which are part of the recruitment rules or are considered necessary for grant of promotion or which entitle them to any additional allowance, are not included. Till such time that the list of courses is revised, we recommend that the existing list may continue to be operative.

QUALIFICATION PAY FOR MNS OFFICERS

**Our
recommendations**

132.6 At present qualification pay at the rate of Rs. 45 p m is admissible to MNS Officers for undergoing prescribed courses. We find that these courses offer only a one-time qualification and should be covered under qualification grant. Accordingly, we recommend that the existing qualification pay for MNS officers may be converted into a lump sum qualification grant of Rs. 3,000/-, which is the rate we have recommended for qualification grant under category IV courses. The Ministry of Defence may review the list of prescribed courses for MNS Officers following the same criteria we have laid down for revising the courses admissible for qualification grant. Till such time the review is done, the existing list will continue to be operative.

QUALIFICATION PAY FOR FLYING QUALIFICATIONS

**Existing
position**

152.7 Qualification pay is granted to Air Force, Naval and Army Aviation officers who are required to obtain certain flying qualifications, which are to be updated periodically by appearing in tests/ examinations conducted by an appropriate board. There are three monthly rates of qualification pay viz. Rs. 125, Rs. 100 and Rs. 70 for three categories of personnel (the categorization either denotes instrument rating or proficiency in flying duties).

Armed Forces Suggestion 152.8 The Armed Forces have suggested an eight-fold increase in the existing rates of qualification pay and its extension to airmen aircrew and their counterparts in the Army and Navy, though at reduced rates.

Our recommendations 152.9 We recommend that the existing rates of this allowance be doubled and it may be called 'qualification allowance' instead of 'qualification pay'. However, we do not find adequate justification for extending the qualification pay to airmen aircrew in view of possible repercussions on other PBOR acquiring specialised skills.

TECHNICAL PAY

Existing Position 152.10 Technical pay is admissible to officers of the technical branches or arms for possessing or acquiring higher technical qualifications after joining the service. It was introduced in 1951 as an incentive in order to overcome the consistent shortfalls in induction to technical branches. It is granted on a graded basis depending on the type of the qualification or duration of the course. This allowance ranges from Rs.75 p.m. to Rs.375 p.m.

Armed Forces Suggestion 152.11 The Armed Forces have suggested a nine-fold increase in the rates of technical pay and have separately submitted a proposal to the MOD for revision of the list of courses eligible for grant of technical pay. The Fourth CPC had recommended, among other things, an increase of 50% in the rates of Technical Pay.

Our recommendations 152.12 We find that the qualifications and courses, for which technical pay is granted, involve only a one-time effort. For civilian employees, we have separately recommended a lump-sum incentive for acquiring higher qualifications. In order to ensure uniformity, we recommend that the existing monthly technical pay may be converted into a lump-sum one-time grant and be known as 'Technical grant'. The following rates for the grant are suggested :-

For specified post-graduate/ diploma courses	Rs. 20,000/-
---	--------------

For specified technical courses of more than 6 months' duration	Rs. 15,000/-
---	--------------

For technical courses of 3-6 months' duration	Rs. 9,000/-
--	-------------

152.13 The list of courses eligible for getting the grant may be finalised by the MOD in a time-bound manner. Till such time the revised list is finalised, the present list may continue to be operative.

SURVEY PAY

- Background* 152.14 Survey pay is granted to Naval officers and sailors employed on survey duties, as a consideration for the specialised knowledge required, long periods of stay at sea and also as an incentive to attract volunteers for survey duties. Before the Third CPC, officers employed on survey duties were entitled to an annual survey bounty and a monthly survey allowance, whereas sailors were authorised only the annual survey bounty. The Third CPC found no justification in having a monthly survey allowance over and above the Annual Survey Bounty and recommended the discontinuance of the monthly survey allowance for officers. The Fourth CPC recommended replacement of Survey bounty by a monthly survey pay.
- Existing position* 152.15 At present, there are five rates of survey pay for survey officers, ranging from Rs. 200 p.m to Rs. 350 p.m. The rates are related to the classification of the survey personnel. The non-survey officers on board ships are granted 50% of the lowest rate of survey pay for survey officers. For the sailors, there are four rates of Survey pay ranging from Rs. 50 p.m to Rs. 125 p.m. The rates are again related to the classification of survey personnel. Non-survey sailors on board ships are granted 50% of the lowest rate of Survey pay for Survey sailors.
- Our recommendations* 152.16 We have considered the Armed Forces suggestions regarding revision of the rates of Survey pay. **We recommend that the present rates may be doubled and the existing survey pay be renamed as 'Hydrographic Survey Allowance'**
- Armed Forces' suggestion for introduction of new allowances* 152.17 The Armed Forces have suggested introduction of a new allowance to be named as 'Aerial Survey Allowance' for officers and airmen aircrew of the Strategic reconnaissance Squadron in the Air Force and a Military Survey Allowance for army personnel engaged in Military Survey work.
- Our Views* 152.18 We have considered the Armed Forces suggestion with reference to the existing hydrographic survey pay for the Naval personnel and we feel that while the grant of hydrographic survey is connected with the hardships associated with long periods of stay at sea, similar justification for the Air Force and the Army does not exist. In view of this, we are unable to recommend introduction of these allowances.

SPECIALIST PAY

- Existing position* 152.19 At present, specialist pay is admissible to the officers of the Army Medical Corps and Army Dental Corps who fulfil the necessary qualification criteria and who form a part of the specialist pool or hold certain appointments authorised for specialists. The existing rates of Specialist pay are as under:

Graded specialist	- Rs. 400 p.m.
Classified specialist	- Rs. 500 p.m.
Consultant/Advisor	- Rs. 600 p.m.

Our recommendations 152.20 The Armed Forces in their joint memorandum have suggested a substantial increase in the rates of specialist pay. We have carefully examined their suggestions, keeping in mind the existing provision of two years antedated seniority and higher initial pay for the AMC/ADC officers. **We recommend that the existing rates of Specialist pay may be doubled.** Further, Specialist pay may be renamed as specialist allowance.

Armed Forces' suggestion for introduction of new allowance 152.21 The Armed Forces have also suggested introduction of Post-Graduate Allowance for Medical Corps., Dental Corps and Veterinary Corps officers in possession of Post-Graduate degree/diploma and not in receipt of specialist pay.

Our Views 152.22 At present, Veterinary Corps officers undergoing courses of higher specialisation are entitled to qualification grant. We are, therefore, unable to recommend introduction of Post Graduate allowance for Veterinary Corps officers. However, for Medical corps and Dental Corps officers who are outside the specialist pool and who do not get any benefit for possessing higher qualifications, **we recommend introduction of post-graduate allowance at the same rates as for Civilian Medical officers under the CHS, i.e Rs. 500/- p.m. for post-graduate degree holders and Rs. 300/-p.m for post graduate Diploma holders.** The Post Graduate allowance would be payable for the period that they are not eligible for grant of specialist pay.

SUBMARINE TECHNICAL PAY

Existing position 152.23 Submarine Technical pay at the rate of Rs. 50/-p.m is admissible to Naval Artificers and Mechanics for the period they are deployed on submarine maintenance duties. This allowance ceases to be paid when they revert to the general service.

Armed Forces' suggestion 152.24 The Armed Forces have suggested introduction of Aeronautical/Submarine Technical Pay at the rate of Rs. 500/- p.m., which while subsuming the existing Submarine Technical pay, will also be admissible to Aircraft tradesmen of Group - I in the Air Force, Air Artificers/Mechanicians in the Navy and equivalent tradesmen in the Army.

Our recommendations 152.25 We have carefully considered the Armed Forces suggestion in the context of existing intra-as well as inter-Service trade relativities and do not find adequate justification for introduction of the allowance for any new category of personnel. However, **we recommend that the rates of the existing Submarine Technical Pay may be doubled and it be renamed as Submarine Technical Allowance.**

LANGUAGE AWARDS

Existing position 152.26 Language Awards are given to the Service officers and PBOR to

encourage them to learn foreign languages to enable them to carry out instructional translations and interpretership duties as and when required. The existing provisions and rates of language Awards are as under:

- (a) The first three defence personnel in order of merit who pass Advance Diploma Part-II in each language, obtaining 65% marks or above, get one-time Language Awards at the following rates:

Category of Foreign Language	Rates for sponsored Candidates	Rates for non-sponsored Candidates
Category I	Rs. 500/-	Rs.750/-
Category II	Rs. 350/-	Rs.500/-
Category III	Rs. 250/-	Rs.350/-

- (b) The first three defence personnel in order of merit, who pass interpretership examination in each language with 70% marks and above, get one-time Language Awards at the following rates.

Category of Foreign Language	Rates for sponsored Candidates	Rates for non-sponsored Candidates
Category I	Rs. 1000/-	Rs. 1500/-
Category II	Rs. 750/-	Rs. 1000/-
Category III	Rs. 500/-	Rs. 750/-

Armed Forces' Suggestions

152.27 The Armed Forces have suggested a four fold increase in the rates of Language Awards and introduction of incentive Awards for Indian Languages.

Our recommendations

152.28 We recommend that the existing rates of Language Awards may be doubled. However, we do not find sufficient justification to recommend introduction of incentive awards for Indian Languages.

LANGUAGE ALLOWANCE

Existing position

152.29 Language Allowance is granted to Service personnel for the period they are actually performing the instructional/translation/ interpretation duties involving the use of any of the specified foreign languages. Continuance of this allowance is subject to the recipient passing the proficiency test to be conducted every year. The existing rates of Language Allowance are as under:

Category of Foreign language	Rates of Language Allowance
Category I	Rs 150/- p.m
Category II	Rs 125/- p.m.
Category III	Rs 100/- p.m.

152.30 The Armed Forces have suggested that the rates of Language Allowance may be enhanced 4 times and the yearly qualifying proficiency test may be held every alternate year. They have also suggested introduction of proficiency pay at 50% of the rates of Language Allowance for qualified personnel not performing instructional/translation/ interpretation duties involving the use of foreign language.

*Our
recommendations*

152.31 We recommend that the existing rates of Language Allowance may be doubled. However, we are not in favour of changing the periodicity of qualifying proficiency test. We also do not find justification to introduce the suggested Proficiency pay.

SHORTHAND ALLOWANCE

Existing position

152.32 Shorthand Allowance at the rate of Rs. 60/-p.m. is granted to Writer Branch Sailors of the Navy and Airmen clerks of the Air Force when they are performing duties of Stenographer and are attached to specified appointments. In the case of the Army, no such allowance is given to Personal Assistants, as they are remustered from Group 'B' to Group 'A' on becoming Personal Assistants.

*Armed Forces'
Suggestion*

152.33 The Armed Forces have suggested that the existing rates of Shorthand Allowance may be enhanced to Rs. 300/- p.m and the allowance be admissible to all qualified personnel performing duties of a stenographer irrespective of their attachment to specified appointments. They have recommended that the allowance may be extended to qualified Stenographers of the Army in view of the new integrated pay structure for PBOR proposed by them.

*Our
recommendations*

152.34 We have considered the Armed Forces suggestions and recommend that the existing rates of Shorthand Allowance for the Navy and Air Force may be doubled without any change in the present conditions of grant of the allowance. As we have not recommended integrated pay scales for any category and the existing group system with provision for remustering in the case of Army will continue, the question of extending shorthand allowance to qualified Stenographers of the Army does not arise.

UNIT CERTIFICATE & CHARGE CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE

Existing position

152.35 Artificers and Mechanics of the Navy who have passed the prescribed examinations are granted Unit Certificate and Charge Certificate Allowance, on being certified by a designated competent board/authority. The Unit Certificate authorises the artificer to take independent charge of operating

machinery during a watch at sea. The Charge Certificate authorises the artificer to take overall charge of machinery at sea. Both the allowances are not admissible concurrently. The existing rates of Unit Certificate and Charge Certificate Allowances are as under

UNIT CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE

Lower Rate	-	Rs. 38/- p.m
Higher Rate	-	Rs. 75/- p.m

CHARGE CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE

Lower Rate	-	Rs. 75/- p.m.
Higher Rate	-	Rs. 113/- p.m.
Special Rate	-	Rs. 135/- p.m.

*Armed Forces'
Suggestions*

152.36 The Armed Forces have suggested a ten-fold increase in the rates of Unit Certificate and Charge Certificate Allowances, stating that the rates have not been revised since 1968.

*Our
recommendations*

152.37 As per Government orders, the rates of these two allowances were last revised in 1983. Taking all relevant factors into account, we recommend the following revised rates for Unit Certificate and Charge Certificate Allowances.

UNIT CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE

Lower Rate	-	Rs. 75 p.m.
Higher Rate	-	Rs. 150 p.m.

CHARGE CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE

Lower Rate	-	Rs. 150 p.m.
Higher Rate	-	Rs. 225 p.m.
Special Rate	-	Rs. 270 p.m.

FLIGHT CHARGE CERTIFICATE ALLOWANCE
--

Existing position

152.38 Flight Charge Certificate Allowance was introduced in 1982 in the Navy to compensate qualified Senior Air Artificers/Mechanicians on a ship-borne helicopter flight for discharging higher responsibilities of maintaining and clearing the aircraft for air worthiness in the absence of an Air Technical officer. These Naval Air Artificers/ Mechanicians are examined by a board of specialist Air Technical Officers to ensure that they possess the required skills and competence. The Flight Charge Certificate is valid for one year and the personnel are re-examined every year. The allowance was revised in 1993 and has been renamed as Aircraft Charge Allowance. The existing rates of the allowance are as under :

Chief Air Artificer/Mechanician and above	-	Rs. 150 p.m.
--	---	--------------

Air Artificer/Mechanician
I, II and III

- Rs. 100 p.m.

*Armed Forces
Suggestions*

152.39 The Armed Forces have suggested enhancement of the rates of the allowance and its extension to Gr. I trade of Air Force and equivalent Army Aviation trades, when they are certified to be competent to undertake the same responsibilities as that of Air Artificers of the Navy.

*Our
recommendations*

152.40 This allowance is primarily to compensate the Naval Air Artificers for higher responsibilities discharged on ship-borne helicopter flights where no Air Technical officer is available. A similar situation does not exist in the Air Force and Army and thus we find no justification to extend the allowance to the Air Force and Army. Since the rates of Aircraft Charge Allowance were last revised in 1993, we recommend that they may now be revised as under:

Chief Air Artificer/Mechanician - Rs. 200/- p.m.
and above

Air Artificer/Mechanician I,II - Rs. 125/-p.m.
and III

*Our Views on
Armed Forces
suggestion for
introduction of
new allowance*

152.41 The Armed Forces have suggested introduction of an Air Worthiness Certificate Allowance for Group I (and equivalent) air craft technicians in the three services as compensation for the higher responsibility involved in airworthiness certification. We are unable to accede to this suggestion since the work involved is a part of the normal duties of aircraft technicians.

JUDGE ADVOCATE GENERAL'S DEPARTMENT EXAMINATION REWARD

Existing position

152.42 Officers of the three services who pass the Judge Advocate General's Departmental Examination (the qualifying examination for transfer to JAG branch) are entitled to a reward. The existing amount of the reward is Rs. 1600/- in the case of the Army and Navy and Rs. 2400 in the case of the Air Force.

*Armed Forces
Suggestions*

152.43 The Armed Forces have suggested enhancement of the reward to Rs. 6000/- in the case of Army and Navy and Rs. 9000 in the case of Air Force.

*Our
recommendations*

152.44 We have examined the issue in its entirety. In place of the existing rates of JAG Departmental Examination Reward, we recommend a revised Reward of Rs. 3200 for the three services.

Personnel Related Allowances

INTRODUCTION

General

153.1 The Armed Forces have categorised certain allowances as "Personnel Related Allowances". The allowances which have been considered under this classification are uniform related allowances, hair cutting/cleaning allowance, washing allowance, soap toilet allowance, spectacles allowance etc. Proposals have been made by the Armed Forces for upward revision of these allowances and some rationalisation has also been suggested. We have considered each of these allowances in the succeeding paragraphs.

UNIFORM ALLOWANCE - P B.O.R

Background

153.2 Personnel Below Officer Rank in the Armed Forces have been in receipt of uniforms free of cost in field areas from the days of the Post-War Pay Committee. In field areas, replacements were also free of cost. However, in peace areas, a monthly clothing allowance used to be paid to cover the cost of maintenance and replacement of kit and clothing which were priced at concessional rates called "Special recovery/frozen rates". In 1982, with the switchover from cotton fabric to synthetic material, free issue of clothing in peace areas was also authorised based on a life cycle concept with replacements being issued after expiry of stipulated life. With grant of free clothing, the monthly clothing allowance was discontinued. It was replaced by an annual clothing maintenance allowance meant for upkeep of kit/clothing.

Existing position

153.3 While free issue of uniform items is made to PBOR, on grant of Honorary Commission, Junior Commissioned Officers continue to be entitled to a one-time outfit allowance equal to actual cost of additional kit with which they are required to equip themselves, subject to maximum ceilings. Similarly, Non-Commissioned officers on promotion as JCOs are entitled to an outfit allowance. Apart from these, recruits on enrolment are entitled to a Mufti Allowance of Rs.100/- as payment for purchase of civilian clothing.

Outfit Allowance for JCOs granted Hony. Commission 153.4 The existing maximum ceiling for one-time allowance for JCOs granted Honorary Commission is Rs.1600/- for the Army and Air Force and Rs.2000/- for the Navy, based on recommendations made by the Fourth CPC. The Armed Forces have suggested enhancement of the ceilings to Rs.4800/- and Rs.6000/- respectively. We have gone through the list of additional items of kit for which the allowance is intended to cater and **recommend that the ceilings be enhanced to Rs.3200/- for the Army and Air Force and Rs.4000/- for the Navy.**

Outfit Allowance for NCOs 153.5 Non-Commissioned Officers promoted as JCOs are entitled to a one-time allowance of Rs.250. The Armed Forces have suggested that the rate of this allowance be increased to Rs.2000. We find that the Fourth CPC had recommended a 25% enhancement of the allowance from Rs.200 to Rs.250 and had suggested extension of the allowance to NCOs of all the three services. Taking all relevant factors into account, **we suggest that the existing rate of the allowance may be doubled to Rs.500.**

Mufti Allowance 153.6 The existing rate of mufti allowance granted to recruits as an initial grant for purchase of civilian clothing is Rs.100/-. Considering that it is a token grant to enable recruits to equip themselves with some items of personal clothing, **we recommend that the rates of mufti allowance be increased to Rs.200/-**

UNIFORM ALLOWANCE - COMMISSIONED OFFICERS

Background 153.7 Officers in the Armed Forces, including Lady Medical Officers/Dental Officers and MNS Officers, are given an initial outfit allowance at the time of commissioning, as a grant-in-aid for meeting a portion of the cost of purchase of authorised uniforms and a renewal outfit allowance after completion of every seven years. The initial outfit allowance is placed at the disposal of the training academy for disbursement to officers on commissioning, after adjusting the value of items already issued by the Academy. While the Lady Medical Officers/Dental Officers are paid the allowance at the same rates as other service officers, Military Nursing Service Officers are entitled to lower rates since expenditure likely to be incurred by MNS Officers on their service kit is less. MNS Officers are entitled to a distinctive uniform allowance on transfer from one service to another, as also to a special allowance on appointment at Command and Army Headquarters.

Existing Rates of Uniform Allowance 153.8 The existing rates of the initial and renewal outfit allowance for officers are Rs.3000/- for officers of the Army and Air Force and Rs.3500/- for Naval Officers. MNS Officers are entitled to an initial and renewal outfit allowance of Rs.1000/-. Rates of distinctive uniform allowance and special allowance for MNS Officers are Rs.100/- and Rs.600/- respectively.

Armed Forces Proposals 153.9 The Armed Forces have made two alternative proposals with regard to provision of uniforms for officers. The proposals are based on reimbursement of full cost of uniforms. The first alternative suggests extension of

provision of uniforms in kind to officers by allowing procurement of uniforms from the private sector and making the uniforms available at specified retail outlets from which service personnel may draw their requirements. This would delink the supply of uniforms from the Ordnance Clothing Factory. In addition, a substantial one-time adhoc grant has also been asked for.

Alternative Proposal

153.10 In their alternative proposal, the Armed Forces have suggested that the cost of the kit during training be borne by the Govt. and existing system of parents' contribution towards cost of personal clothing be discontinued. For items issued during training, 50% of the cost of residual value during training be deducted from the initial outfit allowance. The initial outfit allowance proposed is Rs.25,000/- for the Army and Air Force, Rs.28,000/- for the Navy and Rs.14,000/- for the MNS officers. Renewal outfit allowance at the rate of Rs.10,500 for Army and Air Force, Rs.12,000/- for the Navy and Rs.6,000/- for MNS Officers, to be paid in a cycle of 3 years against the existing cycle of seven years, has been proposed.

Our recommendations

153.11 We have considered the two alternative proposals made by the services and have come to the conclusion that it may not be feasible for the Govt. to take up provisioning of uniforms in kind to officers as the number of officers is too small to generate enough competition in the trade and achieve viable rates. Besides, till such time that Ordnance Factories continue as dedicated departmental undertakings, there is an obligation on the Armed Forces to procure these items from them.

Revised Rates

153.12 As regards the demand for full reimbursement of cost of uniforms to officers, we feel that while there is an expected life span for each item of uniform, the need for replacement is dependent on actual wear and tear which in turn depends on nature of postings and consequent usage. The existing system therefore provides the officer the flexibility to replace only the required items while also ensuring careful use of uniform. We also notice a great deal of variation in the expected life of uniform items suggested for officers vis-a-vis existing life for those items for PBOR. Besides, even civilian employees though not in uniform incur some expenditure on clothes for office wear and if full cost of uniforms is reimbursed to service officers, it would be difficult to deny a similar benefit to civilian employees also. Keeping all these factors in mind, we recommend that the existing rates of uniform allowance for service officers (including MNS officers) be doubled.

Other Suggestions

153.13 Regarding the expenditure incurred by parents on uniform items of cadets during training, since this is for items of personal clothing we do not recommend any change. No change is also recommended with regard to the existing position on reduction of cost of items issued during training from the initial outfit allowance.

Distinctive Uniform allowance

153.14 The Armed Forces have proposed enhancement of Distinctive Uniform Allowance for MNS Officers from Rs.100/- to Rs.500/-. This allowance is presently admissible upto the rank of Major. Extension of the allowance upto the rank of Brigadier has also been suggested in view of upgradation of ranks after cadre reviews. We recommend that the rates of the allowance be doubled and the allowance be extended to all officers of the MNS up to the rank of Brigadier when transferred from one service to another.

Special Uniform Allowance

153.15

As regards the special allowance payable to MNS Officers on appointment at Command and Army Headquarters, the Armed Forces have recommended discontinuance of the allowance as it was granted to meet the cost of winter uniform which has been now included as winter ceremonial uniform for all MNS Officers. In view of this, we recommend that the special allowance for MNS Officers on appointment at Command and Army Headquarters be discontinued.

KIT MAINTENANCE ALLOWANCE

Background

153.16

Kit Maintenance Allowance was sanctioned in 1950 at the rate of Rs.30/- per month to Armed Forces officers upto the rank of Brigadier, having regard to the fact that officers are normally required to maintain these types of kit, namely, service kit, civilian kit and kit for ceremonial occasions. The rate was enhanced to Rs.40/- in 1967 and Rs.50/- in 1970. The existing rate of kit maintenance allowance, which is exempted from income tax, is Rs.50/- per month for MNS Officers and Rs.100/- for all other Service officers.

Armed Forces Proposals

153.17

The Armed Forces have proposed enhancement of the kit maintenance allowance for officers to Rs.500/- per month and for MNS officers to Rs.250/- per month.

Our recommendations

153.18

We recommend that the rate of Kit Maintenance allowance for Armed Forces Officers (other than MNS) be increased to Rs.200/- per month and for MNS Officers to Rs.100/- per month.

PERSONAL MAINTENANCE ALLOWANCE

General

153.19

In addition to uniform related allowance, Personnel Below Officer Rank in the Armed Forces are also entitled to certain allowances granted for personal maintenance. These include hair cutting/ cleaning allowance, washing allowance, soap toilet allowance and clothing maintenance allowance. In addition a Rum and Cigarette Allowance is also admissible.

Hair cutting/Cleaning Allowance

153.20

Hair cutting allowance is granted to PBOR when services of a barber are not provided and during leave. For Sikh personnel a hair cleaning allowance at the same rate is granted. The rate of this allowance was last revised from Rs.3/- per month to Rs.5/- per month on the recommendations of the Fourth CPC.

Washing Allowance

153.21

Where washing services are not provided in kind, PBOR in the Army and Air Force are granted washing allowance at the rate of Rs.15/- per month.

Provisions for Navy

153.22

In the Navy, since services are not provided in kind, hair cutting/cleaning allowance and washing allowance are paid at a composite rate of Rs.20/- per month to sailors when ashore and Rs.25/- per month when afloat.

Soap Toilet Allowance

153.23 Personnel Below Officer Rank in the Navy and Air Force are entitled to one toilet soap (100 gm.) in kind per month. However, Army personnel are paid an allowance of Rs. 8.80/- per month.

Rum and Cigarette Allowance

153.24 Prior to 1985, free issue of rum was made to troops in all areas and cigarettes were issued in field and high altitude areas. In 1985, the free issue of rum and cigarettes was replaced by a cash allowance to wean them away from the habit of smoking and drinking and protect them from the hazardous effects of alcohol and nicotine. In 1992, Government took a decision that the rates of the allowance would not be enhanced further. The existing rates of the allowance are:

Areas	Rum (in Rs. per month)	Cigarette
1. Peace Areas	13.25	
2. Field areas below 3000 ft.	13.25	18.80
3. Field areas between 3000-4999 ft.	29.40	18.80
4. Field areas between 5000 -8999 ft.	35.30	18.80
5. High altitude areas	58.80	18.80

Conditions

153.25 The allowance is paid on monthly basis for the period a person is physically present in the above areas.

Clothing Maintenance Allowance

153.26 As already brought out in para 153.2, an annual clothing maintenance allowance was sanctioned to PBOR in 1986 on introduction of terycot uniforms. The existing rates of the clothing maintenance allowance are Rs.50/- p.a. for the Army and Air Force and Rs.75/- per annum for the Navy.

Armed Forces Proposals on allowances related to personal maintenance

153.27 The Armed Forces have suggested enhancement in the rates of Hair Cutting/Cleaning Allowance, Washing Allowance, Soap Toilet Allowance, Clothing Maintenance Allowance and Rum and Cigarette Allowances. They have also proposed clubbing together of these allowances to be paid at a monthly rate of Rs.200/-, roughly a four-fold enhancement. It has been suggested that the composite allowance may be renamed as 'Personal Maintenance Allowance' and the present practice of issue of toilet soap in kind to the Navy and Air Force may be discontinued.

Recent Developments

153.28 We have examined the existing rates and conditions of grant of these allowances. We find that Ministry of Defence have issued orders in March 1996 clubbing the hair cutting/cleaning allowance, washing allowance, soap toilet allowance and the clothing maintenance allowance and renaming it as Personal Maintenance (Hygiene) Allowance to be granted at a monthly rate of Rs. 32/- where services are not provided in kind.

*Rum and
Cigarette
Allowance*

153.29 While the Ministry of Defence have not clubbed the Rum and Cigarette Allowance in the Personal Maintenance Allowance, the Armed Forces proposal envisages inclusion of this allowance also in the consolidation. While we have no objection to clubbing of this allowance, we are not really convinced of the necessity to continue these two allowances. It may not be possible to discontinue the rum allowance as it may lead to some resentment. We are, however, convinced that there is enough justification to discontinue the cigarette allowance altogether, in the light of medical findings on the confirmed damaging effects of nicotine.

Revised Rates

153.30 Keeping in view the Govt. decision not to revise the allowance further and in accordance with our recommendation on discontinuing the cigarette allowance, we suggest the following rationalisation in the rates of 'Rum Allowance':

- | | | |
|----|--|--------------|
| 1) | Peace Areas | - Rs.15 p.m. |
| 2) | Field Areas below 3000 ft. | - Rs.35 p.m. |
| 3) | Field Areas between
3000 - 4999 ft. | - Rs.50 p.m. |
| 4) | Field Areas between
5000 - 8999 ft. | - Rs.55 p.m. |
| 5) | High Altitude Areas | - Rs.80 p.m. |

*Clubbing of
Allowances*

153.31 As regards the other allowances, we feel that clubbing together of these allowances and granting these at a uniform rate for the three services would reduce paperwork. We accordingly agree with the suggestion that the allowance be renamed as 'Composite Personal Maintenance Allowance'. The individual and composite rates for peace areas where services are not provided in kind may be fixed as under:

<u>Allowance</u>	<u>Suggested Rates</u>
1. Hair Cutting Allowance	- Rs.10 p.m.
2. Washing Allowance	- Rs.30 p.m.
3. Rum allowance	- Rs.15 p.m.
4. Soap Toilet Allowance	- Rs.10 p.m.
5. Clothing Maintenance Allowance	- Rs.10 p.m.

Composite Personal Maintenance Allowance	- Rs.75 p.m. -----

153.32 Where services are provided in kind and for the Rum Allowance component in field areas and in high altitude areas, the rates of the allowance may be adjusted suitably. With this rationalisation, the distinction between sailors afloat and ashore would also be done away with.

SPECTACLES ALLOWANCE

Existing Position 153.33 Armed Forces personnel are supplied with spectacles at public expense, provided the impairment of vision is attributable to service. In addition, spectacles are also supplied to PBOR provided that while serving in the Armed Forces their sight is so defective that it materially interferes with their efficiency and vision can be improved to render them efficient. Ex-servicemen discharged due to ophthalmic disability are also entitled to the facility. The existing rates of reimbursement on account of purchase of spectacles are:

- a) For spectacles with normal lenses - Rs.25/-
- b) For spectacles with bifocal lenses - Rs.49/-
- c) For repair of spectacles/frames/
replacement of lenses - actual
expenses subject to a ceiling of - Rs.15/-

Our recommendations 153.34 The Armed Forces have suggested considerable enhancement in the reimbursement made on this account. We have considered the issue and agree that the present rates of reimbursement are inadequate. We therefore recommend that the rates of spectacles allowances for normal lenses may be revised to Rs.65/- and for bifocal lenses to Rs.125/-. These rates would include amounts needed for repairs from time to time and no separate allowance need be paid for repairs. The present procedure of reimbursement for repair on case to case basis may, therefore, be dispensed with.

ACTING ALLOWANCE

Existing position 153.35 An acting allowance is admissible to Junior Commissioned Officers appointed in officers' vacancies arising as a result of shortage of officers but not caused due to the officer proceeding on leave, temporary duty or course of instruction. The allowance is admissible only so long as the JCO performs the duties of an officer and no consequential promotions/appointments are made in place of JCOs appointed in lieu of officers.

Acting Allowance for JCOs 153.36 The existing rate of acting allowance for holding appointments tenable by Captain and equivalent is Rs.150/- per month and for holding appointments tenable by Majors and equivalent is Rs.200/- per month. These rates have been in force since 1986. Keeping in view the additional responsibilities discharged by JCOs while holding appointments of officers, we recommend that the existing rates may be doubled.

Commissioned Officers 153.37 Commissioned Officers who hold acting rank are at present entitled to the rank pay of the officiating rank. Prior to the introduction of the integrated pay scale, if an acting rank was held for a continuous period of more than 21 days, the officer became entitled to the pay scale of the acting rank. Since we have separately recommended that service officers may be brought on to regular

scales of pay, our recommendations in the chapter on Pay Structure of Officers as to how the pay for acting rank is to be regulated will apply

FUNERAL ALLOWANCE

<i>Existing position</i>	153.38	The actual funeral expenses of Armed Forces personnel whose death occurs while on active field service or serving in a mission/post abroad is a charge against the state if the funeral is carried out by military authorities. When funeral is carried out by relatives or friends, or when death occurs in a peace station, grant-in-aid in the form of funeral allowance is paid. The present rate of funeral allowance, which was last revised in 1993, is Rs.750/-.
<i>Mortuary Charges</i>	153.39	In cases where it becomes necessary to preserve dead bodies of Army personnel in a mortuary awaiting arrival of next of kin to take part in the funeral, mortuary charges incurred are reimbursed upto a ceiling of Rs.35/- per day for a maximum period of three days.
<i>Armed Forces Proposals</i>	153.40	The Armed Forces have proposed that rates of funeral allowance may be increased to Rs.4000/- and that of mortuary charges to Rs.100/- per day. It has been suggested that cost of coffins, transportation and embalming of bodies may be borne by the Govt where dead bodies have to be transported to far flung areas of the country. Requirement of pre-audit of claims have also been urged to be dispensed with.
<i>Our recommendations</i>	153.41	We have examined the proposals and find that there is full justification for the full cost of a funeral being reimbursed where death takes place while on active field service. We, therefore, recommend that in all cases where death occurs while on active field service or serving in a mission/post abroad, the entire funeral expenses including cost of transportation, embalming and coffins may be a charge against the state, irrespective of whether the funeral is carried out by military authorities or relatives. When death occurs in peace areas, funeral allowance at a rate of Rs.1000/- may be granted. We also recommend that in all cases mortuary charges may be reimbursed as per actuals without any ceiling. As regards procedure for payment, it is recommended that requirement of pre-audit of claims may be dispensed with and the Commanding Officer may make advance payment on the spot.

CONSERVANCY AND WATER CARRIER ALLOWANCE

<i>Background</i>	153.42	Where Junior Commissioned Officers (JCOs) and Other Ranks (ORs) of the Armed Forces are entitled to quarters, they are also allowed free conservancy which includes provision of services of sweeper and water carrier. Where these services cannot be provided in kind, an allowance in lieu is granted. The element of water carrier is not admissible if piped water supply exists in quarters where personnel are living. The allowance is fixed by the station commander after ascertaining the rate at which such services are obtained by civilians of equivalent status subject to maximum rates being fixed by the Govt.
-------------------	--------	---

Proposals

153.43 The Armed Forces have stated that due to piped water supply being available in almost all areas, water carrier allowance is no longer relevant. They have suggested renaming of the allowance as conservancy allowance and revision of its rate to Rs.75/- p.m. for all PBOR against the existing rates of Rs.20/- p.m. for JCOs and Rs.15/-per month for Other Ranks.

*Our
recommendations*

153.44 In view of the position brought out by Armed Forces, we agree that water carrier allowance may be discontinued. With regard to enhancement of conservancy allowance, our approach is that in municipal areas conservancy services are looked after by the municipality and in cantonments they should be looked after by the Cantonment Boards. In view of this and since we have separately recommended considerable enhancement of accommodation related compensation, we do not see justification for the continuance of a separate conservancy allowance. We, therefore, recommend that the existing Conservancy and Water Carrier Allowance may be discontinued.

NEW ALLOWANCES

Our View

153.45 The Armed Forces have separately recommended introduction of a camp kit maintenance allowance for officers. We have gone into the matter but find ourselves unable to agree the proposal.

Travel Entitlements

INTRODUCTION

Background

154.1 The rules governing travel entitlements of Armed Forces personnel are by and large similar to those applicable to civilian personnel. However, the entitlements for class of travel are based on rank unlike civilian employees where the pay drawn determines the class of travel. While on temporary duty, variations in the entitlements exist mainly in the grant of daily allowance, such allowance for service personnel being restricted by the nature of duty depending on whether free board and lodging is provided. For permanent duty moves, unlike civilians, the entitlements make a distinction between single personnel and married personnel, and PBOR are entitled to a cash allowance instead of the transfer grant admissible to civilians.

CLASS OF TRAVEL

Present Position

154.2 The existing entitlement of Armed Forces Personnel for class of travel for both temporary duty moves and permanent duty moves is as follows:

Rank	By Rail	By Air
Lt. Generals & above	1st Class AC	Executive Class
Col. to Maj.Gen.	1st Class AC	Economy class
2nd Lieut. to Lt. Colonel.	AC 2 tier	-
JCOs	1st Class/AC Chair Car	-
ORs	11nd Class Sleeper	-

*Armed Forces
Proposals:*

154.3 The Armed Forces have suggested that entitlement to class of travel for both service and civilian personnel should be determined on the basis of basic pay. Upgradations in class of rail travel for NCOs, JCOs and other ranks have been suggested. For JCOs and above entitlement has been sought to travel by air in India.

*Our
recommendations*

154.4 We have examined the issue in the context of the existing position and the proposed revisions for civilian employees, who are also being brought on to a level wise classification for purpose of travel entitlement. Keeping in view our recommendations for Civilian employees we recommend the following revised entitlement for Armed Forces personnel:

Lt. Genl and above	-	Air (J) Class in domestic flights & 1st Class in international flights/AC I Class train
Col. to Maj. Gen.	-	Air economy (Y) class in case of domestic flights and business/ club class in case of foreign flights/AC I class train
2nd Lt. to Lt.Col.	-	Air economy Class/AC II Tier train
JCOs	-	AC II Tier train
ORs	-	IIInd Class Sleeper
NcsE	-	IIInd Class Sleeper

*Travel on first
appointment and
by road*

154.5 Consequent to upgradation in class of travel of JCOs by rail, we suggest that entitlement of service officers on first appointment may also be upgraded from 1st class to AC-II tier. No air travel may however be authorised. With regard to travel by road, our recommendations made for civilian employees will apply.

*Other
Suggestions*

154.6 Other suggestions made by Armed Forces relate to grant of permission of travel by air on flights operated by private airlines and not Indian Airlines alone, delegation of powers for authorising air travel to non-entitled personnel to Vice Chiefs and GOC-in-C and equivalent and extension of provisions for use of railway saloons to Naval and Air Force counterparts of Army Commanders while on duty within their commands.

*Our
recommendations*

154.7 We have considered each of these suggestions and are of the view that the decision regarding travel by private airlines may be left to the Government. As regards delegation of powers, in view of the liberalisation recommended in the rules with regard to air travel, the present provisions may continue. We also do not find justification to extend the use of railway saloons to Naval and Air Force counterparts of Army Commanders.

PERMANENT TRANSFER ENTITLEMENTS

Introduction

154.8 Permanent transfer entitlements of Armed Forces Officers who are married are the same as those for civilian personnel. For officers who do not possess a family, while the transfer grant is paid at the same rates as admissible to married officers, the packing allowance and baggage entitlement are one-third of the entitlement of married personnel. PBOR are entitled to conveyance of self and of baggage on warrant. Conveyance of family and baggage at married rates is determined by whether or not the soldier is on the authorised married establishment. Instead of the transfer grant, a cash allowance is paid to PBOR provided they are on the authorised married establishment.

Existing entitlement

154.9 The existing rates of transfer grant/cash allowance, packing allowance and entitlement to transport baggage are as follows :

TABLE : ENTITLEMENTS OF OFFICERS ON PERMANENT TRANSFER

CATEGORY	Transfer Grant (Rs.)	Packing Allowance (Rs.)	Baggage Allowance (Kgs.)
A. Officers having pay of Rs.5100/- and above			
i) Having family	4000	1500	6000 kgs
ii) Not possessing family	4000	500	2000 kgs
B. Officers drawing pay between Rs. 2800-5099 including Hony. Commissioned Officers			
i) Possessing family	3000	1200	6000 kgs.
ii) Not possessing family	3000	400	2000 kgs.
C. Officers having pay of less than Rs. 2800/-p.m			
i) Possessing family	1500	900	3000 kgs
ii) Not possessing family	1500	300	1000 kgs
iii) Midshipman of the Navy	1000	300	1000 kgs

TABLE : ENTITLEMENTS OF PBOR ON PERMANENT TRANSFER

CATEGORY	Cash Allowance (in Rs.)	Baggage Entitlement		Packing Allowance	
		Married	Single	Married	Single
		(in kgs)		(in Rs.)	
i) JCOs	300	3000	500	900	150
ii) NCOs	225	1500	250	600	100
iii) Ors	200	1000	250	450	100

*Proposals made
by Armed Forces*

154.10 The Armed Forces have proposed that the existing flat rates of transfer grant be changed to one month's basic pay for married personnel and half month's basic pay for single personnel. It has been demanded that cash allowance admissible to PBOR be also replaced by transfer grant. Packing allowance has been suggested to be revised to 50% and 25% of basic pay for married and single personnel respectively. As regards baggage entitlement, the following modifications have been suggested.

1. Personnel entitled to move by air may be made entitled to transfer baggage by air, the reimbursement being limited to entitlement by rail+80% thereof.
2. Baggage entitlement for transportation by road be increased to rail entitlement + 40% thereof.
3. Baggage entitlement for course of instruction upto 180 days be revised from the existing railway free allowance and additional 20 kgs. available to Officers.
 - (i) Officers - 150 Kgs. + two wheeler
 - (ii) JCOs/ORs - 100 Kgs. + two wheeler
4. Baggage entitlement to and from field areas be revised to 150 Kgs. for officers and 100 Kgs. for PBOR.

*Our
recommendations*

154.11 We have in our chapter on Travelling Allowance for civilian employees recommended a composite transfer grant of one month's basic pay subsuming the existing transfer grant and packing allowance. The Armed Forces in their proposals have not recommended any change in the basic distinction in travel entitlements between married and single personnel. Keeping in view the existing relationship between rates of transfer grant and packing allowance for married and single personnel and considering the decision made for civilian employees, we recommend the following "composite transfer grant" for officers of the Armed Forces:-

	Married	Single
Officers	1 months's basic pay	80% of basic pay for a month.

154.12 The issue of converting the cash allowance for PBOR into a transfer grant was considered by earlier Pay Commissions also. The Third CPC had expressed the view that it was not desirable to apply civil TA/DA provisions to PBOR regardless of differences in conditions of service. Besides, pay scales had been prescribed by them taking into account the frequent changes of station. The Fourth CPC suggested that Government may go into the issue taking into account the conditions under which PBOR move on transfer. We have examined the issue and find that PBOR have been made entitled to journey DA on transfer and are entitled to transfer baggage on free railway warrants. Free accommodation and rations are also provided on joining the new duty station. Considering all these factors, provision of transfer grant at civilian rates to PBOR may not be justified. In view of the free accommodation and transport provided at government expense and keeping in view the relativity the cash allowance bears with pay, we

recommend the following 'composite transfer grant' for PBOR

	Married	Single
JCO/OR	50% of basic pay	25% of basic pay

We however recommend no change with regard to the applicability conditions

Transfers within same station 154.13 For transfers within the same station where a change of residence is necessitated solely on account of the transfer we have recommended a 'Composite Transfer Grant' equal to one third of monthly basic pay to be paid in the case of civilian employees. While applying it to Armed Forces personnel, we recommend that for transfers within the same station one third of the entitled composite rate as proposed by us in para 154.11 may be paid.

Baggage Entitlements 154.14 With regard to baggage entitlements, as for civilian employees, we recommend that full reimbursement of actual expenditure in case of transport of personal effects by road may be made. We are, however not in favour of transportation of baggage by air. No change in the existing position on transportation of baggage for undergoing courses of instruction is suggested. However, baggage entitlement to and from field areas may be revised as under:

	Existing	Proposed
Officers	65 Kgs.	100 Kgs.
JCOs	28 Kgs.	50 Kgs.
ORs	12 Kgs.	25 Kgs.

The total quantity of baggage transported including baggage transported by the family may, however, not exceed the maximum entitlement of the personnel.

DAILY ALLOWANCE

Present Position 154.15 At present rates of daily allowance applicable to civilian employees also apply to Armed Forces personnel. No daily allowance is however, admissible to personnel who are provided food and accommodation at Government expense in field service concessional areas. In other areas, PBOR on temporary duty are paid 25% of daily allowance if provided with free board and lodging and 50% of DA + Ration money when not provided with free board and lodging.

Service Proposals 154.16 The Services proposals with regard to daily allowance include:

payment of hotel tariff where mess accommodation is not available

payment of daily allowance for 21 days at these rates to officers reporting on permanent transfer

payment of DA at half rates to personnel proceeding on temporary duty to Naval ships

payment of DA for training camps/exercises including those at sea.

*Our
recommendations*

154.17 We have considered these suggestions and keeping in view the existing parity in rates of daily allowance admissible to civilian and Armed Forces personnel, we recommend that rates of daily allowance recommended by us for civilians may apply to service personnel also. The following categorisation of personnel for purposes of Daily Allowance is suggested :-

- | | | |
|----|--------------------------------------|---|
| 1) | Top Executives and Senior Executives | Majors General and above |
| 2) | Executives | IInd Lieutenants to Brigadiers and equivalent |
| 3) | Supervisory Staff | JCOs and equivalent |
| 4) | Supporting Staff | NCOs, ORs and equivalent |
| 5) | Auxiliary Staff | Non-combatants (enrolled) |

*Hotel
Accommodation*

154.18 As far as provision of hotel accommodation is concerned, in our estimation requirement of hotel stay for PBOR will be minimal in view of adequate facilities for accommodation already available. While the authorisation may be the same as for civilians, for Service Officers also hotel stay should be resorted to in extreme cases as availability of mess accommodation in Armed Forces is generally better than guest house availability for civilians. While permitting hotel stay, it may also be ensured that mess accommodation in any mess in the station is not kept vacant.

*Other
Suggestions*

154.19 Regarding other demands made on daily allowance, we do not recommend grant of daily allowance on posting to a station in view of the introduction of composite transfer grant which in our opinion would give adequate compensation. We also feel that the restriction of daily allowance where facilities are provided for board or lodging is sound in principle and, therefore, do not recommend any change in the position with regard to daily allowance admissible for temporary duties on naval ships and while on training camps/exercises.

MISCELLANEOUS PROVISIONS

General

154.20 The Armed Forces have made certain proposals with regard to other travel related provisions. We have discussed each of the proposals in the succeeding paragraphs.

*Conveyance of
patients*

154.21 It has been suggested that existing provisions available to families of PBOR whereby free conveyance is admissible to patients transferred from one service hospital to another and back in case of emergency may also be extended to Service Officers. Considering that civilians are also entitled to travelling allowance in similar circumstances, we are of the view that extension of these provisions to Service Officers under the same conditions is justified and recommend accordingly.

Other Provisions 154.22 For conveyance of dead bodies, it has been suggested that free conveyance of deceased personnel from place of death to place of funeral be authorised and all other travelling expenses as admissible on retirement be granted. We have, under our recommendations on Funeral Allowance, outlined the responsibility of the State where death takes place while on active field service. For death in other circumstances, the existing provisions are adequate and no change is therefore suggested. We also find ourselves unable to agree with the suggestion made with regard to conveyance of relatives of service personnel, placed on dangerously ill list or for attending funerals of deceased service personnel, as the existing provisions are quite reasonable.

154.23 Some suggestions have also been made by the Armed Forces for provision of travel of wives of Colonel Commandants and equivalent, Army Commanders and equivalent and travel of wives by Service aircraft. We are unable to accede to these proposals in view of possible repercussions on other employees.

*Daily Allowance
for Civilian
Candidates* 154.24 Civilian candidates called for interview for grant of commission in Armed Forces are normally lodged and boarded at Government expense. Daily allowance is admissible for halts at Rs. 15 per day in metropolitan cities and Rs. 10 per day in other cities, if board and lodging are not provided. It has been suggested that rates of Daily Allowance for these candidates should be brought at par with those applicable to Group C personnel. Since these candidates are not government employees, we are not convinced of such a substantial increase in the rates. We suggest that as far as possible for such candidates arrangements should be made for free board and lodging. However, we recommend an increase in the rates of daily allowance to Rs. 30 per day in metropolitan cities and Rs. 20/- per day in other cities for those not provided with such facilities.

Leave Travel Concessions

INTRODUCTION

General

155.1 The existing schemes of Leave Travel Concession (LTC) for Armed Forces personnel differ from schemes available for civilian employees. In view of the military role and the separation from family inherent in a military career, provisions relating to leave travel concession are more liberal than the corresponding provisions on the civil side.

SCHEME FOR OFFICERS

Home Town L.T.C. for Commissioned Officers

155.2 A Service Officer proceeding on annual/casual leave is eligible to travel on free railway warrant along with his family, by the main route to and from the nearest railway station to his home town once in two years.

Conveyance to any place in India

155.3 Apart from concession for travel to hometown to Service Officers and their families being allowed, once in each calendar year, free conveyance to and from the place where they intend to spend their casual/annual leave subject to the journey not exceeding 1450 kms in each direction is also given. For Officers posted to field areas or non family stations, LTC is admissible to the family from the station at which they are residing to leave station of the officer.

Special Provisions

155.4 Army Air Observation Post Pilots, Air Force and Navy aircrew personnel and pilots on flying duties as well as submarine personnel are entitled to a free journey once every year upto a total journey of 1600 kms. for onwards and return journey (both inclusive) in the appropriate class. This is in addition to other leave travel concessions.

Reduced Fare Certificate

155.5 Service Officers when travelling on leave at their own expense are allowed on production of form 'D' to travel by entitled class or lower class on payment of 60% of the fare of the class travelled. The total number of 'D' Forms to the officer, his wife and dependent children for travel to any station is restricted

to six one-way journey forms in a calendar year. For MNS Officers similar concession available on Form 'G' is equivalent to 50% of the fare.

SCHEME FOR PBOR

*LTC Scheme for
PBOR*

155.6 For personnel below officer rank in the Armed Forces, the following scheme exists:-

- (i) PBOR when proceeding on annual/casual leave are granted free conveyance on warrant to home station and back once in a year. When the family travels with him, the expenditure incurred by the individual on a concession voucher is reimbursed to him.
- (ii) Once every alternate year, the PBOR has the option to travel with or without his family to a leave station other than home station instead of his journey to his home station. On the individual exercising this option, he is reimbursed the expenditure incurred on concession voucher for outward and return journeys, subject to a distance of 1450 kms each way.
- (iii) Service Personnel Below Officer Rank when travelling on leave at own expense are allowed to travel in the entitled or lower class on payment of 50% fare of class in which they actually travelled. This concession is also available to families.

TRAVEL ENTITLEMENT

Class of Travel

155.7 The class of travel and mode of conveyance entitled while availing themselves of Leave Travel Concession is as follows.

<u>Rank/Pay</u>	<u>Class of Travel</u>
1. All Service Officers including MNS Officers, Midshipmen and Honorary Commissioned Officers.	AC 2 Tier Sleeper/1st class by rail
2. JCOs and equivalent	1st Class/AC Chair Car by rail
3. NCOs, ORs and Non Combatants (enrolled)	IInd Class Sleeper by rail

Restrictions

155.8 Leave Travel Concession is not admissible for journeys by private car or bus, van or other vehicles owned or operated on charter by private operators. Travel by private buses operating a regular service from point to point at regular intervals on fixed fare rates, with the approval of Regional Transport Authority/State Govt. concerned, is admissible. However, reimbursement authorised in such cases is limited to cost of railway warrant.

SERVICES' PROPOSALS

*Armed Forces
Proposals*

155.9 The Armed Forces have suggested that the class of entitlement for travel by rail should be the same class as entitled for moves on duty. With regard to the concessions themselves, two alternative proposals have been made. The first envisages replacement of the existing leave travel concession scheme by an annual leave travel allowance to be introduced initially for service officers and extended gradually to PBOR. In case the first option is not considered acceptable, it has been suggested that the existing scheme be modified with a view to abolishing the concept of home town, granting free conveyance on leave to any station in India subject to a maximum of 2500 kms. each way and permitting use of private cars. Ceiling for dependency of parents has been sought to be revised to Rs.5000 per month against the existing Rs.500 per month. Removal of restriction on number of 'D' Forms and reduction of liability on 'D' Forms to 50% and concession vouchers to 10% has also been suggested. It has been recommended that present provisions for additional free conveyance to aviation/submarine personnel may continue and be extended to all those in field areas/afloat and to special forces.

SUGGESTIONS ON LEAVE TRAVEL CONCESSIONS

*Recommendations
made by Earlier
Pay Commissions*

155.10 While examining the issue, we found that the Third CPC had recommended continuance of the special privileges available to service personnel with regard to travel concessions. For officers they suggested removal of kilometre restrictions on travel to hometown. A limit on number of 'D' forms was, however, suggested for introduction. For PBOR, the Third CPC suggested free travel to home-town once a year and in alternate years an option to travel to any other station was introduced subject to certain limits. The Fourth CPC while considering the issue recommended raising of the limit of free conveyance for PBOR from 965 to 1450 kms. and extension of the facility of free conveyance to selected leave stations to families even when not residing with the serviceman.

*Our
recommendations*

155.11 We have considered the various suggestions made by the Armed Forces regarding leave travel concessions and **do not recommend replacement of the existing scheme by an annual leave travel allowance in view of the considerable financial implications involved. However, in our chapter on Leave Entitlements of Armed Forces personnel we have already outlined the limited scheme of encashment of leave to be permitted concurrent with availing of LTC. This will be applicable to the Armed Forces personnel also.**

Other Proposals

155.12 Regarding the other proposals made on Leave Travel Concession, we consider that the existing special privileges available to Service personnel are adequate and do not require any change. The additional benefits available to aviation and submarine personnel are also recommended to be continued in the present manner. We suggest that ceiling for dependency of parents for coverage under leave travel concessions may be enhanced to Rs. 1500 per month.

*Changes in Class
of Travel*

155.13 With regard to entitlement to class of travel by rail, in keeping with recommendations made for civilians, **we agree with the suggestion that the**